

WORKPACKAGE 4

INSTITUTIONAL DISCRIMINATION IN CYPRUS

REPORT BY¹

Nicos Trimikliniotis

**Research and Interviews by and Yiannos Papayiannis, Josie
Christodoulou, Eleftheria Vouti, Galatia Agathokleous**

CONTENTS

I. Map of Cyprus

II. Introduction The Context and Current Conjuncture

1. Background overview of the two cities covered in the report: economic characteristics, socio-cultural aspects, and political conditions

2 Institutional Case Studies: A brief characterization of the organisations covered

(a) Schools,

(b) Labour mediating organizations

(c) Public and

(d) Private enterprises.

3. Specific observations, insights, indication of key mechanisms

Appendix 1: Interview Schedule

Illustration1: Map of Cyprus



Table 1: Cyprus Demographic Characteristics by City, Age, Gender, and District 2003

PLACE OF RESIDENCE	TOTAL¹	MALES	FEMALES	URBAN²	RURAL
TOTAL	688.345	332.955	355.391	505.900	224.500
0-14	148.208	75.943	72.265		
15-24	86.198	40.458	45.741		
25-34	101.490	48.015	53.475		
35-44	107.035	51.327	55.708		
45-54	93.859	46.384	47.475		
55-64	69.829	34.046	35.783		
65+	81.726	36.783	44.943		
NICOSIA					
TOTAL	271951	130.900	141.051	213.500	75.600
0-14	55299	28.438	26.861		
15-24	34.357	16.164	18.194		
25-34	41.593	19.698	21.895		
35-44	41775	19.620	22.155		
45-54	38.805	18.800	20.005		
55-64	27.913	13.730	14.183		
65+	32.208	14.450	17.758		
LARNACA					
TOTAL	114.729	55.638	59.092	74.900	47.000
0-14	26.560	13.576	12.984		
15-24	14.785	6.856	7.929		
25-34	16.336	7.736	8.600		
35-44	17.995	8.718	9.277		
45-54	14.849	7.450	7.399		
55-64	10.862	5.322	5.540		
65+	13.342	5.979	7.363		
LIMASSOL					
TOTAL	197.559	94.972	102.587	167.800	41.400
0-14	42.216	21.369	20.846		
15-24	24.330	11.481	12.848		
25-34	28.685	13.434	15.251		
35-44	31.053	14.830	16.223		
45-54	26.651	13.166	13.485		
55-64	20.862	9.992	10.869		
65+	23.763	10.700	13.063		
PAPHOS					
TOTAL	66.058	32.403	33.656	49.700	20.400
0-14	14.575	7.575	7.000		
15-24	7.806	3.602	4.204		
25-34	9.090	4.300	4.790		
35-44	10.202	5.114	5.088		
45-54	8.785	4.487	4.298		
55-64	6.918	3.370	3.548		
65+	8.682	3.955	4.727		

¹Source Cyprus Statistical Service, Labour Force Survey 2003.

² Source Cyprus Statistical Service, Population by District 2003, information free online.

1. Background overview of the two cities covered in the report: economic characteristics, socio-cultural aspects, and political conditions

The aim of this work package is to identify and analyse patterns and mechanisms of institutional, taken-for-granted discrimination in local labour markets and education in Cyprus. Via the empirical studies conducted this work package will attempt to assess the extent to which and precisely how selected patterns are affected by what we define as “the politics of racism”.

For Cyprus, a small *divided* country of only 9,240 sq km and a population of 775,927 (July 2004 est.), we have decided to retain as places of study the three cities/towns that were examined in WP 1: (a) Nicosia (or Lefkosia) remains the central city in focus as it is the largest populated town and capital of Cyprus, (b) the second city under investigation is Limassol (or Lemassos), the second largest city of Cyprus with a population of about 150,000 and the third town is Paphos, which is quite unique as it is quite small when compared with other towns in Cyprus.

According to the latest available data the total population of the area, which is under the control of the Republic of Cyprus in 2003, were 688,345 persons, having a slight increase compared to the figure of 2002, which was 679,269. The figures do not include the population of Turkish-Cypriots, estimated between 100,000 to 200,000, who reside in the northern part of the territory, since 1974 under Turkish military occupation (see map above). As far as gender is concerned females slightly outnumber males with a 51.6% over the total population. The age category of 0-14 years old has the highest membership (22% of the population) followed by the 35-44 and 25-34 years old age categories. The ratio of urban versus rural is 2.25 meaning there are 2.25 persons living in the urban area per person living in the rural area. The highest population percentage is concentrated in Nicosia (almost 40%) followed by Limassol (29%). Limassol has the highest urban concentration with over 4 persons living in urban areas per person in the rural district. Larnaca has the lowest urban concentration with an urban over rural ratio of 1.59 (see table above).

Some background information

Ethnic groups: Greek 78% (99.5% of the Greeks live in the Greek Cypriot area; 0.5% of the Greeks live in the Turkish Cypriot area), Turkish 18% (1.3% of the Turks live in the Greek Cypriot area; 98.7% of the Turks live in the Turkish Cypriot area), other 4% (99.2% of the other ethnic groups live in the Greek Cypriot area; 0.8% of the other ethnic groups live in the Turkish Cypriot area)

Religions: Greek Orthodox 78%, Muslim 18%, Maronite, Armenian Apostolic, and other 4%

Languages: Greek, Turkish, English

The Economy

The Greek Cypriot economy is prosperous and has witnessed steady growth since 1974. Nevertheless, the economy is highly susceptible to external shocks, as it is primarily tourist-driven. Erratic growth rates over the past decade reflect the economy's vulnerability to swings in tourist arrivals, caused by political instability in the middle east region and fluctuations in economic conditions in Western Europe. Economic policy is focused on meeting the criteria for admission to the EU. EU-driven tax reforms in 2003 have introduced fiscal imbalances, which, coupled with a sluggish tourism sector, have resulted in growing fiscal deficits. The Turkish Cypriot economy has roughly one-third of the per capita GDP of the south. Since the unrecognised Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus (TRNC) is recognized only by Turkey it has difficulty arranging foreign financing and investment. It remains heavily dependent on agriculture and government service, which together employ about half of the work force. To compensate for the economy's weakness, Turkey provides grants and loans to support economic development. Ankara provided \$200 million in 2002 and pledged \$450 million for the 2003-05 period. Future events throughout the island will be highly influenced by the outcome of negotiations on the UN-sponsored agreement to unite the divided country since the 1974.

Greek junta coup and Turkish invasion and occupation

Short City Guides

Nicosia

Nicosia's population and area grew dramatically since the British rule, for a number of reasons including: the fact that it is the centre of government and has most of the bureaucratic services, has attracted large companies and expanded the import oriented market, and has a large inflow of people coming from rural areas to settle in the capital (urbanisation). The capital has attracted also a number of important industries, situated primarily in industrial zones in the outskirts of the city. It is the most 'modern' city of Cyprus and has an important historic centre within the Venetian walls, which is also a commercial centre. Many structural problems related town planning derive from the fact that the city has been divided for over 30 years between the Greek Cypriot and Turkish Cypriot sectors, with a zone in the middle called 'the dead zone' patrolled the UN peace keep forces. Nicosia attracts many migrant communities who work in the industries of the capital and provide services not offered by Cypriots. Thousands of migrant workers (Pontians, South East Asians, Arabs and Eastern Europeans) live in the city-residing in all the poorer neighbourhoods of the capital. A large number of migrant workers reside in the city centre which is close to the 'Green Line' and thus 'downgraded' as ghettos [RAXEN ...]. Since April 2003, when occupation regime in the north partially lifted the restriction on freedom of movement among Greek Cypriots and Turkish Cypriots, allowing the two communities to mingle, most of the exchanges happen via the two cross points of the capital: One at the centre of the city, via the historic hotel *Ledra Palace* (for diplomats in limousines and those crossing on foot) and one in the suburb of *Ayios Dometios* or *Kermia* (for cars). Thousands of people cross over: Greek Cypriots visiting friends or their homes and lands (now resided by Turkish Cypriots) or even crossing over out of curiosity, thus or even to frequent one of 90 or 80 casinos in the north. On the other hand many Turkish Cypriots would cross over to the south

estimated at about 10,000 to work in the south primarily as skilled or semi-skilled workers in the construction as well as other industries.

The city has its own 'centres': (a) the historic centre which is rather 'under-developed' as there are barrack, sand sacks and young Greek-Cypriot soldiers bored out of their heads 'guarding against the enemy' on the other side. Similarly on the other side young Turkish-Cypriot soldiers would be equally boiling under the hot daily sun and bored during breezy Nicosia night. Close to the *Green Line* cheap and ill-kept accommodation is provided to the poor, students, foreign students and migrants Pontians, Pakistanis, Indians, Sri Lankans and others(see Papadakis, 2004). (b) Another centre is the modern commercial site along Makarios Avenue with trendy cafes, designer shops and clothes shops.

Platia Eleftherias (Freedom Square) is the central square where all-important political rallies take place; it is also the most frequented public meeting point for migrants and poorer people. The other popular place is the Hospital Park – a Sunday meeting point for migrant workers.

Limassol

Limassol covers the south part of Cyprus with an area covering the 15% of the whole island (1393 km²) and with 80 km being coastal. The inhabitants of Limassol living in the rural area are occupied with agriculture, stockbreeding, fishing, tourism and handicraft making. Limassol has a highly developed tourist industry that begun after the 1974 Turkish invasion due to the occupation of the pre-1974 popular tourist resorts located in Kyrenia and Famagusta. Limassol is also an industrial centre with approximately 350 units being involved in wine and drinks making, dress and shoe making, and metal and plastic industry. The presence of the British bases at Episkopi and Akrotiri, the large inflow of refugees after the invasion, and the fact that the harbour is located in the city make Limassol an attractive commercial centre. The main harbour of Cyprus is located there and there is a large number of migrant communities, as well as an indigenous Turkish-Cypriot community, a few hundred of whom have stayed in the town even after forced separation of populations in the immediate aftermath of the Greek junta coup and Turkish military invasion of 1974. As far as the work places selected these were selected from Nicosia and Limassol. The migrant workers live in cheap flats and houses in poor neighbourhoods in the centre of the city, near industry sites and generally all downgraded areas. Many Pontians are concentrated in the area near the municipal library.

In Limassol the sites frequented by migrant communities are the historical centres of Limassol in the area around the Public library square (particularly by Pontians), the municipality park next the appalling for its residents, municipal Zoo and the public square next to the old harbour, known as *Molos* (particularly frequented by south east Asians from the Philippines, Srilanka and India). Turkish-Cypriots and Romas frequent the old Turkish-Cypriot sector of Limassol and the Market or *Pantopolion* of Limassol. The presence of migrants, particularly on Sundays, when they are off work has been an issue of controversy and at some points, (in 2000 and 2001), Asian women complained that the Police harassed them for using public benches and the municipal parks for 'too long' and demanding that move every hour. The Police

eventually dropped the matter amid media complaints. Since then a number of incidents were reported such as rioting and fights between Greek-Cypriot and Pontian youths in Public library square in the summer of 2004 (see Trimikliniotis, 2003).

Paphos

The city of Paphos lost population throughout the British rule since many of its inhabitants moved to other cities such as Limassol and Nicosia. Until 1974 Paphos remained a small unspoilt city, with some important touristy attractions due its archaeological findings; over the last ten years or so it has become a major tourist destination with large hotels, restaurants, shops to cater for the thousands of tourists who frequent the coastal area of 'Kato Paphos'. Another important feature of Paphos is the mountainous rural and agricultural region, which is well known for its wineries and fruit production and which has developed a 'trendy' type of tourism known as 'agro-tourism'. Since 1998, when there was a liberalisation of migration policy, Paphos became a prime destination for migrants, particularly from the former soviet Republics of Greek-origin Pontians and has a large concentration of Pontian migrants.

In Paphos the media-amplified issue is the alleged 'criminality' and 'bad behaviour' of the Pontian communities, who reside near the old Paphos and the district of *Muttalos*. Interestingly it was the Pontian youth who became the most vigorous defender of retaining the *public* character of the coastal area known as *Mbania* or *Public Baths*. The mass presence of Pontians in Paphos, who were not 'behaving' in mode accepted by the middle class ethic acceptable to the local entrepreneurial elite, who wanted to the exploit commercially, to commercialise the only *Public Baths* (*Δημόσια Μπάνια*) in the Cyprus. In 2000-2001, there were complains by migrant workers that the Limassol police were trying to prevent South-East Asian women from using the public benches and the municipal park over the weekends³. This relic of the Ottoman days remains the public, free and open to the *subaltern* classes to swim in deep waters became the centre of a local conflict of the kind or model of development of the area. Even though, the campaigners was made up only by a handful of local Paphian activists the presence of the Pontians altered the dynamic in favour of the retention of the public baths. The struggle to retain the baths against the commercialisation, the expansionist kitsch of the plastic chair and table which has spread all over and a 'good manner' of behaviour tailored around middle class behaviour and norms that may exclude the ethnic 'other', particularly if they appear scruffy, poor and of a more working class identity.

Migrant workers and local Public Spaces and Struggles

Migrant worker become important *factors* in the local city struggles, not necessarily as conscious political action or praxis, but something that may result in unintended consequence, but may in fact be something beyond. Migrant workers and other marginalized groups and certain radical Greek Cypriot intellectuals and pro-migrant

³ See the relevant press release by the Immigrant Action Group (2001).

activists, who joined for in action to ‘defend public space may well be agent of a novel phenomenon in the process of becoming agents of *new* subaltern activism. This is not the result of an agency based on organisation and planning not in the sense of a ‘conscious agents’ of social change, but through common struggle they became *structural* carriers of a *subalternity* derived from the marginal social status, position and their vested interests to defend public spaces as free and open meeting points, happenings and hang-outs from privatisation, commercialisation and becoming middle class areas. The ‘ghosts’ of what was once considered as the struggles of the rural and urban poor, the working classes for the public sphere as a free and open to all public meeting place, a kind of *modern agora* to use the analogy an analogy of ancient Athens: this is a group that that has nowhere else to go; only in a *public* space. In short, its Pontain who have the material incentive and social identity as the *subaltern Other* to generate what Castells once called *Mouvements sociaux urbains* provided that they are able to communicate and act together breaking the ethno-cultural barriers without necessarily ‘losing them altogether’ (Castells 1973).

Brief characterization of organisations covered

Given the size of Cyprus and the size of the enterprises under study must be modified accordingly, i.e. downwards. Nevertheless the employers selected are quite large for Cypriot standards and render themselves for investigation, with the qualification that one needs to bear in mind that most employment in Cyprus consist of much smaller enterprises with no facilities and personnel office, more akin to a family business structure².

Public Bodies and Private Enterprises in Nicosia and Limassol

The *two private institutions* under investigation are:

- (a) A *College*, one of the largest and most academically acclaimed educational establishments, after the University of Cyprus, which has over 500 employees in most of the towns in Cyprus.
- (b) A hotel which is a large sized five star hotel in Limassol, employing 190 employees, set in over 20,000 square meters of landscaped gardens with exotic trees and sub-tropical plants, which extend to the seashore and it features 255 well appointed bedrooms including 13 superior rooms 11 suites.

The *Public bodies* under investigation are two important bodies:

- (a) The Cyprus Police force, which has 4099 members, including 683 Regular Special and Special officers in different positions of rank. The current force was set up during the British colonial times, but the modern structure dates from the establishment of the Cyprus Republic in 1960.³ The Police have recently been at the centre of controversy when the chief of Police, during a press conference stated that he was concerned with the involvement of immigrants in crime alleging that, ‘one in three crimes involve foreigners’⁴
- (b) The Limassol municipality is the largest municipality in terms of persons residing within its boundaries and employs 500 persons. No migrants can be employed in any public body unless they (i) become Cypriot (and recently European) citizens and (b) they are certified as proficient Greek speakers.

EXPERT REPORTS

Report of the expert interviews in Cyprus

Background

We have conducted 20 expert interviews in Cyprus. The persons interviewed were representatives of different organisations (NGOs), journalists, lawyers, MPs and writers. All of them have worked with migrant issues, education, diversity for several years. Given the size of Cyprus, the historical development of social sciences and the concentration of expertise in the capital (many of whom may come from different regions), the research team decided to keep three cities under investigation (particularly as regards the schools examined. It therefore make little sense to divide experts according to city of current residence. The experts selected reside and work or have worked in the 3 different cities under investigation; nevertheless there are more experts from Nicosia, due to the fact that the Capital has concentrated more NGOs, colleges, Government departments, news papers and media. All 20 ‘experts’ are compiled together in one Report and are analysed according to their opinions.

3. In which of the following areas of life would you say immigrants and their children have the greatest likelihood to experience discrimination?

Please mark how great likelihood the immigrant have of experience discrimination in the following sectors by marking one of the boxes.

Not likely

Very likely

Labour market		1		7	9
Workplace		1	1	6	10
Housing			6	4	7
Medical service	1	3	6	3	4
Daily life (neighbourhood, means of transport)	1	1	4	6	4
Political participation	1	2	1	1	12
Schools		2	5	6	6
Education	1	1	6	6	6
Discrimination in their own immigrant group	5	2	6	2	2
Police				3	17
Other contacts with authorities		2	4	7	5
Shopping	2	5	4	4	1
Restaurants, bars, dance clubs	2	4	4	5	2
Other, what? Media					2
Welfare					2

A total of 20 interveiwees completed the table

4. Describe a typical example of discrimination.

Most experts agree that one of the main examples of discrimination takes place as a super-exploitation of migrants. Others referred to the discrimination taking place on matters relating to their stay status (issuing, renewing visas, deportation etc). Some

experts referred specifically to the treatment of domestic helpers, who are treated as inferior beings. There is a sharp distinction in the answers depending on the kind of issues the different 'experts' deal with or have insight knowledge. For example, those dealing with educational issues gave examples of employment situations as well as educational discrimination, in contrast to those who have no dealings with educational and schooling issues, who gave relatively low ranking to the likelihood of educational and school discrimination in question 3 above.

Labour Markets and Workplaces

5. What mechanisms explain relatively high unemployment among immigrants and their difficulties in obtaining a job?

In the case of Cyprus the issue of unemployment is not affecting the migrant population in the same way that it may be affecting other European countries, as the migrants to enter Cyprus they must first obtain a job and their stay is dependent on having a job. The vast majority of migrant workers, primarily drawn from 'third countries' before Cyprus formally acceded to the EU on May 1st 2004 are on stay conditions of this kind, therefore unemployment does not theoretically arise. The second-generation migrants are still very young and very few and in any case most short – term immigrants are repatriated after 5 years. Very few 'third country' nationals get to stay in Cyprus on a permanent basis. Some experts have made a share distinction between the situation in Cyprus when compared with other European countries.

Unemployment is generally not in issue as Cyprus has one of the lowest unemployment rates in the EU (currently at about 4.5%), but there is upward trend which has begun to worry certain sectors of the population. The communities affected by unemployment may be the Turkish-Cypriots and Roma (unemployment is believed to be very high in the occupied territories) and to some extent the Pontian Greeks, Pontians reside in Cyprus on a Greek (i.e. European passport). Some experts point out that unemployment is not high between migrants but "*Romas and Pontians face problems that can be referred to as "social discrimination" that can explain to an extent their relatively higher level of unemployment in Cyprus*" (see CYPexpNI, CYPexpGP). Others relate this to the unstable political situation in Cyprus.

The main problem in the Republic of Cyprus is that most migrants (as well Turkish-Cypriots and Romas residing in the area under the control of the Republic) are concentrated in low status, low pay and low skill jobs that Cypriots will avoid if they can help it.

6. In your judgment, to what extent are differences between natives/majority group and immigrants / ethnic communities in obtaining jobs dependent on active discrimination on the labour market? Explain. Or are the patterns mainly the result of concerns about the reactions of other employees and/or clients?

There is disagreement about this issue and different experts referred to a different opinion. Most informants considered that the main problem derives from the very

exploitative nature of the employment immigration model of Cyprus, which ties the migrant to the specific job. Turkish-Cypriots are thought to be in a slightly better position. Apart from the employment model some informants see Cypriot society as a racist society reproducing intolerance, racial discrimination and prejudice.

Experts suggest that there are different reasons for discriminatory practices in Cypriot society: Stereotypes by employers, opportunistic exploitation of migrant workers in a vulnerable position, some employers experts 'concern' about what other Greek – Cypriot employees say or what clients say. Others point to the inadequacy of the mechanisms to tackle discrimination via the ineffective legal framework available. Others pointed to the fact that racism also derives from the political problem of Cyprus. Most experts considered that trade unions are not playing a positive role in tackling racism and discrimination against migrant workers as well as Turkish Cypriots. Some experts were particularly critical of the way trade unions have been instrumental in reproducing racist stereotypes in the island explaining this as mere xenophobic.

Currently there are 7,000 – 8,000 Turkish Cypriots working in the southern part of Cyprus and only 1,500 are registered and are members of the trade unions. However, there were trade unionists and some other experts point out that recent initiatives by Trade Unions illustrate that at least some Trade Unions are trying to organise migrant and Turkish Cypriot workers. The trade unionists interviewed pointed to the difficulty they have in unionising migrant workers as well new initiatives at least one trade union to create a migrant workers bureau to cater for the needs of migrant workers.

Comment:

One has to recognise the long way Cypriot trade unions have come from adopting an explicitly defensive and xenophobic stance in the early 1990s to turning around to the extent that some trade union are becoming articulators of concerns of migrant workers and are becoming more and more open to membership. With the Turkish Cypriots matters have been different. They have always been a strong tradition of bi-communal co-operation, even before Greek Cypriots and Turkish Cypriots could be physically in contact and engaged in common struggles. The All – trade Union Forum, which consists of Greek Cypriots and Turkish Cypriots trade unions, has created a sound basis for common action and cultural-political space for communication that transcends the ethno-communal divide. As such the 'traditional ties' were 'picked up' very quickly indeed when Turkish Cypriots were allowed to cross over and work in the south. Nevertheless, there are problems, many of which derive from the current political situation which has left Cyprus in a state limbo with the area under the control of the Republic acceding to the EU. Contrary to the last 28 years with the long-standing Turkish intransigence, Ankara and the Turkish-Cypriot leadership have shown 'good will' to resolve the Cyprus problem; nevertheless, this has only resulted in Ankara winning over western and European public opinion with its own accession aspirations, whilst the northern territories of Cyprus currently under Turkish military occupation are left outside the EU pending a solution.

8. Or, are other factors operating to explain differences in employment/unemployment patterns between immigrants/ ethnic and minority groups (e.g. Turkish-Cypriots) and natives/majority group. Such explanatory

factors might be, for instance, a lack of necessary education or skills, or lack of language competence? Which?

Almost all experts agree that language; skills and education are factors in themselves that may be barriers for the advancement and obtaining better jobs. Equally there is a near unanimity amongst the experts that such factors are simultaneously used and abused by employers to pay or agree lower standards, terms and conditions of employment. Some experts insist that it is the immigration and employment made of Cyprus that produces and reproduces the problem of over – representations of migrant workers in the lower echelons of the labour hierarchy and / or racism is in this way reinforced in society.

As for the employment of Turkish Cypriots due to the Cyprus problem, the uncertainty about the future and differences in language and culture there is a gap and failure to recognise the skills of Turkish Cypriots.

9. In what sectors are there the greatest barriers to recruitment of immigrant / ethnic and minority groups (e.g. Turkish-Cypriots)? Explain. To what extent are their barriers in the public sector [in Sweden] to immigrant recruitment? All levels? Which sectors are the most open in recruiting immigrants/ ethnic and minority groups (e.g. Turkish-Cypriots)? Explain.

The Cyprus public sector does not employ non-Cypriots (now non-Europeans) as this prohibited by law. There is also the language proficiency, which a requirement by law for all those who are graduated of non – Greek speaking universities.

For Turkish Cypriots matters are different, but due to the history and persistence of the Cyprus problem Turkish Cypriot, a recognised community and equal partner with the Greek Cypriots are not employed in the Cyprus public sector. Since the abandonment and exclusion of Turkish-Cypriot political leadership from the consociational government since 1964, which provided that 30% of all public servants be Turkish-Cypriots, no Turkish-Cypriot have been since employed in the public sector. With the partial lifting of the restrictions in the freedom of movement by the regime in the north, some Turkish-Cypriots have been employed as translators and helpers on an hourly basis in services which involved Turkish-Cypriots requiring identity cards, medical certificates, passports or other administrative services, but this number is very small.

10. Are there forms of recruitment, e.g. types of announcement, that discriminate against immigrants/ ethnic and minority groups (e.g. Turkish-Cypriots)? Is there a form or forms of announcement that distinguish immigrants/ ethnic and minority groups (e.g. Turkish-Cypriots) from natives/majority group? Explain.

Some experts have expressed ignorance of any such *direct* types of ethnic discrimination (i.e. types of announcement) but many jobs are only advertised in Greek, which obviously exclude all non-Greek speakers (Turkish-Cypriots, most migrants etc). One expert referred to the requirement of knowledge of Greek and English as discriminatory against Turkish-Cypriots, as Turkish, which is also an official language of the Cyprus Republic is not included. Certain types of jobs are considered as ripe for certain type of migrants (e.g. south East Asians are seen as

‘suited’ for domestic maids). CYPexpD, a journalist has seen announcements with this kind of discrimination; he gave us a personal example also heard when one was asking for a housemaid but required that is “not a very black one because her children don’t like her”. He also suggested that has heard that “when a domestic worker is young, some parents allow their children to have sex with her”.

11. How is competence typically judged?

Many of the experts claim that competence is judged in the level of performance. Oddly enough, *none* of the experts considered that there is anything arbitrary or bias in the way competence is being judged, even persons who deal with employment issues of workers (particularly migrants and ethnic minorities) as matter of routine, such as specialist lawyers and trade unionists. One expert suggested that further research is required.

12. Does discrimination arise simply on the basis of the preferences of the employer?

In general, the experts believe only to a marginal extent and rather indirectly will discrimination arise on the basis of the individual *preferences* or biases of the employer, although this does feature via cultural reasons that shape opinions. In fact the vast majority experts strongly believed that employers would act primarily out of economic interest and in line with profit maximisation and not due to personal prejudice: the employer would pay less a migrant or Turkish-Cypriot if he/she can get away with it lightly and enough to generate a profit. Most experts considered discrimination being ‘functional’ to profit maximisation and economic gain (i.e. pay less for more hours, less social insurance):

“If for example the collective agreement says that workers in the construction industry work for 37 hours a week and they force a foreigner worker to work for 50 they do so because a specific financial profit exists and less because of their perceptions regarding people from different ethnic groups”.

13. Do stereotypes play a role in recruitment procedures? Which? Give example.

Most experts in Cyprus believe that stereotypes may play a role in recruitment procedures, but not to the extent that they do in Europe. One expert suggested that “this is another question that addresses European practices where you might confront the dilemma of employing a German or a Turk with permanent residence” but in Cyprus “an employer overcomes his perceptions and stereotypes in order to serve his personal interest”. Another expert suggested that stereotypes seem to fit in with the drive for profit “*where one cannot find Cypriot workers. The employer will use a foreigner “slave” to do the job*” (CYPexpGP). CYPexpDK points out that being “*black*” or “*colour*” it plays a significant role and especially if these groups mentioned are working at restaurants. On expert suggest that

“Stereotypes play an important role in recruitment procedures where the employee will come in contact with customers and offer services; the employers have the impression that appearance will attract more

people so employers turn to tall, fair-haired, European instead to other opposite stereotypes that to most people are dislikeable”.

14. Are persons hired through particular social networks?

The experts say that persons are many times hired through social networks; in fact social networks, nepotism and ‘contacts’ is the game in any type of work in Cyprus. This is known as ‘*rousfeti*’ and it is one of the most common ways of obtaining a job, ‘goodies’, government and other services. Employment agencies with necessary ‘contacts’, individuals with the ‘right connections’ can obtain interviews, any permits and papers required and have an unfair advantage in obtaining desired jobs. Nevertheless, the ‘*rousfeti*’ and networks is considered a general malaise in society, against all, Cypriots and non-Cypriots, majority and minorities alike and is therefore not considered to be particularly discriminatory against migrants and ethnic minorities and communities

When it comes to migrants in particular social networks are important within the migrant communities themselves. For the employment of Turkish-Cypriots the situation is again dependent on the right contacts.

Comment:

One may make a strong case that the networking may be a ‘general problem’ that affects the natives as well as non-native who do not have the ‘right’ social background, but this by itself is likely to be even more adverse for the migrant and ethnic minority and community populations, who are generally more marginalised than the native / hegemonic ethnic group.

15. To what extent are immigrants hired more than natives in marginal or deviant sectors? Explain.

There is a near unanimity among experts that the most low status, low paid and unpleasant tasks are jobs of migrants. In fact this was the reason migrant workers were allowed to be employed in the first place: the change of policy was the result of the shortage of labour in low skill, low paid jobs and all the statistics show this (as far as the vast majority of 3rd country nationals).

Regarding the Turkish-Cypriots there are barriers such as the persistence of the Cyprus problem and a history of hatred and conflict, most Turkish-Cypriots reside in the north and there is a language obstacle. The vast majority of Turkish-Cypriot workers that are occupied in the free regions are located in the construction industry which needs extensive training. We could not include this employment in the employments without any professional training.

Some experts also referred to the problem of the ‘deviant’ sector as a product of the system itself. One expert refer to possible networks as illegal trafficking and was adamant that “as far as the situation with Turkish-Cypriots 4/5 of illegal entrants come via illegal networks”.

“The best example is prostitution. It’s a job and it only happens with alien women. Of course I saw Greek prostitutions that cooperate with

patron and they with their turn they cooperate with the police and the nation don't accept it. These women are not protected" (CYPexpMG)

Discrimination occurs in the labour market, education, housing, media, it is an everyday experience for most migrant workers; some, who are forced to work illegally, may be pushed to the 'informal' and 'illegal' sector merely as a survival strategy.

16. How do labour market laws and regulations function in these marginal or deviant sectors?

The experts pointed out that we are referring to a shady sector that works outside the law. In fact there seems to be an agreement that there is the 'formal' and the 'informal' system working in parallel. Many experts referred to wide spread violations of contractual terms and the fact that the regulations are simply not followed by the employers.

There is legal framework for the employment of migrant workers, established before accession; with accession this include two categories: the 'third country nationals', which essentially means continuing with the old system, in a more restrictive way and the regime covering EU citizens who are entitled to all the rights that Cypriots enjoy. This is the theory of course, as there are many accusations of violations of the terms of the contract and the tri-partite agreement between Government, employers' organisations and trade unions.

For Turkish-Cypriots matters are more complicated given the political situation as these workers are much more prone to accept terms lower than Greek-Cypriots (e.g. unprotected employment, no national insurance, lower wages) given the uncertainty about the future. One expert pointed out:

According to the law, always theoretically speaking, the Turkish-Cypriots are equal with their Greek-Cypriots co-workers. In practice and wherever trade-union representation of workers doesn't exist, the employer considers the Turkish-Cypriot worker as cheap workforce and subsequently he will recruit him offering lower wage, and without a lot of benefits that their G/C colleagues enjoy. The employer is more likely to do this to a t/c but the motive of profit at the expense of a worker's profit of work is there for e/c workers as well. This is what happens today with the personal contracts.

17. Do qualified immigrants most often only get unqualified or low-status jobs and positions? Explain.

It is common knowledge the migrant workers mostly do low pay, low skill and status jobs. One expert pointed out that

In Cyprus we have the following phenomenon: teachers for example are occupied in the domestic service.

Another expert suggested that he knows "foreigners who are qualified lawyers and doctors and work in constructions".

18. Are there key persons (“gate keepers”) in firms and government offices who can restrict or facilitate

a) Immigrants / ethnic and minority groups obtaining jobs?

When we were referring to the vast majority of migrant workers the regime is temporary and is restricted strictly for a few years, unlike many other European contexts. One expert considered the question not relevant to the Cyprus context:

The question is by no means relevant for a simple reason: the process that is followed in Cyprus. We do not have to deal here in Cyprus with the phenomenon of permanent immigration but for temporary immigration.

Another difference is that immigrants cannot work for the public sector. But the problem is not primarily that of ‘gate-keepers’ but a *systemic* one. One expert was particularly critical of the general situation as regards the employment of migrant workers, which is the result of what he called a ‘closed society’.

We lack of laws and procedures. We are very close society. Whoever comes in this country especially third country nationals are treated like animals. We don’t pay them, we abuse them and they don’t complain the outcome is that they will never have a normal career..

b) Immigrants / ethnic and minority groups having a normal career in a place of work?

Most experts found it very hard to think of actual ‘success stories’ with a ‘normal career’ for this group. The gatekeepers are those in managerial position, heads of personal administration, and most experts could not think of such a position held by migrants or Turkish-Cypriots.

19. Do you know of persons with immigrant background who have such positions? Where? [if any]. Explain.

All but one could think of migrant having such a position:

I do not know immigrants with successful professional careers because they come in Cyprus in order to do a specific job and after they finish it they leave.

The only one expert that seemed to know some Pontians who did relatively well was himself a Pontian expert who said that he knows “some Pontians who are employers, owned their own company” (CYPexpM). Pontians are the only category, who may come from the former soviet Republics but because most of them have Greek passports, they have the opportunity to stay on as European citizens.

As for Turkish-Cypriots there are very few examples of ‘successful Turkish-Cypriots in the south. As one expert said:

There are some Turkish-Cypriots who chose to stay in the free region and live in the Cyprus Republic and managed to have a successful professional career after facing a lot of problems. In order for this thing to constitute a social phenomenon it cannot be referred to one, two or three individuals.

20. What prejudices and stereotypes do key persons have which affect immigrants' fate on labor markets (for example, such gate keepers are the labor market mediators, personal chiefs, etc.)

According to most experts the Cyprus problem is responsible for the ethnocentrism, which in turn caused xenophobia and discrimination. From their statements it seems that they consider that Greek-Cypriots in key positions are xenophobic because they are afraid of "the dangerous and threatening foreigners", the fear that "they will get our jobs" or even "our husbands"

Some stereotypes exist in the minds of these people. One can see that these stereotypes take place if the key people are not educated. For e.g. 'Philippinos are black and uncivilised', 'Russians are hookers' or third country nationals are 'dirty' and so on. The people, who sit there in their offices, judge that these people have no culture as if Cyprus is the centre of the universe.'(CYPexpGP).

Another expert said:

I know a policeman who saw some people from Pakistanis and he was shouting "look at these dirty people, they are still coming". It is a phenomenon that appears very often".

21. Do you know of employers that have been accused of discrimination against immigrants? Indicate these? Were their judicial processes initiated? Are there employers in this area that have a reputation for positive recruitment of immigrants? Indicate a few, if any.

All experts agreed that employers have been accused of discrimination against immigrants. Some of them said that immigrants/ Turkish-Cypriots were not getting paid equally and some didn't indicate any. Moreover, they all said that some of the employers were sued or others sort their differences at the labour court, the ombudsman or even the European court. Some experts said that there are employers with good reputations for positive recruitment though they did not indicate any.

III. Education

22. Are there differences in resources between schools with a high proportion of pupils with immigrant background compared to other schools?

Many experts don't know if there are differences in resources. Some believe that there should not be any differences and some argued that in such schools the ministry should offer them more resources. One of them argued that the ministry is offering help by the 'educational priority zones' (ZEP), who offer Greek language to the children and extra time.

23. How does school segregation affect the quality of education in the segregated schools?

Experts argued that the phenomenon exists and it's more of a social problem as poor families are living in specific neighbourhoods and thus must send their children to the specific schools. Others mentioned that "if the majority are Pontians means that quality will be lower as they will find difficulties in learning Greek, whereas some experts hold the parents responsible to parents saying that "By the time the family help the children at home it doesn't matter whether the child study to segregated schools or not". Others said that it depends on the teachers.

24. Are there teachers with immigrant background who work in the school system, in particular in this city?

Some of them said that they don't know any immigrants working at public schools. An expert said that Pontians might work at schools to support Pontian children. We were told that EU immigrants are working at private schools and teach Italian or French language. A lot of them didn't know if there are any immigrants or ethnic minorities working at schools

25. How much interest is there in the schools recruiting teachers with immigrant background?

Many experts said that there is no interest by the ministry to recruit immigrants or ethnic minorities or Turkish-Cypriots Interestingly one expert pointed out that "Unfortunately it is a governmental procedure. They have to pass the exams that contains the Greek language as well. ... Turkish-Cypriots or migrants are not familiar with the language so it's very difficult", though Turkish-Cypriots have the right to work because they are Cypriots citizens.

26. Are there differences in pay scales and career opportunities when one compares teachers with immigrant background to native teachers?

There are no immigrants or ethnic minorities working at public schools there are no differences in pay scales

27. Are there differences in school performance and how many pupils finish their education between those in segregated schools with large proportion of pupils with immigrant background compared with other schools?

According to experts the reasons of differences in school performance and the reasons

that immigrants or ethnic minorities leaving schools are more due to the socio-economic problems they face which force many of them to work to help out their families and less due to language problems.

28. Is there program-segregation, namely pupils with immigrant background overrepresented in practical programs and underrepresented in theoretical programs? If yes, what is the effects for pupils with immigrant background?

One expert stated “because of language difficulties I guess that migrants are underrepresented in theoretical programs” and other based his answers on stereotypes “migrants are workers in the construction and Greek-Cypriot are not”. One was more optimistic that the problems exist because we are essentially still dealing with the first generation of migrants (CYPexpZ)

29. Are there cases where parents of immigrant background have accused the schools of discriminating?

Most of them said that there were complaints against schools, some have been referred to the Specialised body, the Ombudsman. One example was cited:

“a child didn’t participate in activities as singing, or say a poem because her teacher assumed that she couldn’t make it”.

30. Have the complaints been organized ? Have NGOs been involved?

Most of them said no or that they don’t know except one who is working at an NGO who said that he heard complains regarding discrimination at schools

31. Are there particular key persons (gatekeepers) in the schools who have influence over pupils educational choices? Explain.

Experts said that teachers and counsellors are the key people who influence pupils is educational choices and one of them said “unfortunately they don’t know ways to treat and integrate migrant children”

32. To what extent do these “gatekeepers” rely on stereotypes (with respect to pupils with immigrant background). If yes, what stereotypes. Do you have an explanation of why they are used.

Many of them said it depends on the character of each key person. Those who rely on stereotypes is because if Cyprus ethnic problem and are ethnocentric. Another expert said that education itself is ethnocentric or Cyprus society is racist and that immigrant

or ethnic minorities should follow specific occupations (low skilled occupations)

33. Do pupils with immigrant background have in your view realistic opportunities to enter the university (or other institution of higher education). Explain the answer.

Most of them said no or that very few of them will make it. Refugees have the opportunity to enter the university of Cyprus as they enjoy equal rights with Cypriots, some don't because they don't have Cyprus citizenship but according to the experts many immigrants will not make it because the standards are very high and classes at the university the classes are in Greek. However according to the experts if immigrants, ethnic minorities or T/C have money will manage to study at private colleges.

34. Do those with immigrant background and natives [nationality] have equal opportunities to obtain stipendiums and study-loans? Put another way, is nationality a significant factor when it comes to obtaining a stipendium?

They all said no because to give study loan or such scholarships one need to have the Cyprus citizenship. As for study loan an expert argues that "Banks ask for guarantee and migrants don't have the money to pay guarantees".

However refugees do get scholarship from colleges and finish their studies and as for Turkish-Cypriots they don't enjoy equal rights with Greek-Cypriots.

35. Do you have observations or reflections about how "the other" (the non-[nationality]) is presented in schoolbooks and in classroom discourses? Explain. Give example.

Experts said that schools shouldn't be proud as the educational system promotes xenophobia and present the "others" especially the Turks as inferiors and barbarians and enemies.

A Maronite came at my office and brought me an essay- model. The teacher at the elementary school gave that essay to the Maronites daughter. The essay was about the northern part of Cyprus, saying that "our grandparents and our land still crying, that we must take revenge and follow. The grandfather wants his grandchild to fight for our land and sent back the Turks to their country. They are our enemies.

SCHOOL REPORTS

Background to Education and Schooling in Cyprus:

For the purposes of this report when we refer to education in Cyprus, we are referring to the education provided in the area under the control of the Republic of Cyprus, essentially Greek-Cypriot education, which is under the guidance of the Ministry of Education and Culture. The vast majority of Turkish-Cypriots are educated in the northern territories, who currently under Turkish-Cypriot administration following the invasion and occupation in 1974.

Education in Cyprus is compulsory for all children from the ages of 5 up to the age of 15, of which 6 years are provided for the Primary / Elementary schooling (*Dimotiko*) and a further 3 years for the *Secondary* school or *Gymnasium*. A further 3 years at the Lyceum is required of one is to continue to higher and tertiary education. This education is provided free of charge as a public good. Pupils at the ages of 12 or at 15 can choose to go to a parallel educational system, formally recognised as equal known as technical education at special technical schools (*Technikes Scholes*). At the level of higher education there is also the Teachers college (now incorporated in the University of Cyprus), the Nursing College, the Higher Technological Institute (ATI), the School of Tourism and the School of Forestry. Further more there is the University of Cyprus, the most prestigious public educational establishment.

Apart from the freely provided public education, there is a thriving private educational system, which is also obliged to follow the guidelines of the Ministry of Education as regards curricula and academic standards. The Grammar School, the English School, the American Academy are but some examples at the level of elementary and secondary level. There are two religious minority schools (*Melkonian* for the Armenians and one Maronite School) and one Catholic School ran by nuns. At the level of tertiary education there are numerous private colleges of different standards, some of which are of equal standards to those of Universities and recognised by many Universities in the EK and the EU, although currently not fully recognised as private universities. A new law provides for the procedure for becoming recognised as a university in the next two years. The private colleges are English - speaking and attract thousands of students, not only from Cyprus, but also from all over the world. Some colleges however are not as good as others and have been criticized by the media and ministers for being mere 'fronts' for ensuring visas for migrants.

The level of public education IS generally of high standard and enjoys a good reputation; four of the private colleges are also reputable. Very recently an important Report was published by an academic committee appointed by the Ministry of Education and Culture proposed a general framework for educational reform which is a comprehensive appraisal of the current system with specific proposals for modernisation, reform and restructuring of education (*Δημοκρατική και Ανθρώπινη Παιδεία στην Ευρωκυπριακή Πολιτεία*, August 2004). The bulky 360 pages report, among other proposals proposes an "inter-cultural education for an open democratic society of knowledge" to replace the ethnocentric and narrow educational system currently in the place (see Trimikliniotis, 2004)

Schools

Three schools have been selected from the three cities, which include migrant children and/or ethnic communities other than the Greek-Cypriots such as Turkish-Cypriots and Romas. All Primary schools have been selected, as there is much higher concentration of migrant and ethnic communities, reflecting the history of recent migration to Cyprus and the restrictive policies as regards stay in the country.

- The Faneromeni School in central Nicosia
- The 18th School in Limassol
- The 4th School in Pafos

A brief guide on the geography and the local content and context of the school is given at the relevant section on *Reports on School*.

As explained earlier the three schools under investigation have been selected from three different cities in Cyprus and all have their own specificities, which make them quite interesting case studies in the own right.

The *Faneromeni* School in central Nicosia is one of the first ‘multicultural’ schools in Cyprus and has a high concentration of migrant pupils from many ethnic communities; the largest group is that of the Pontian Greeks and the Greek-Cypriots are in the minority. In this sense it is unique for the capital. The *18th School* in Limassol, situated in the old Turkish quarter, is a school that hosts Turkish-Cypriot and Cypriot Roma children as well as some other migrants. The *4th School* in Pafos, situated in the centre of this small town, is one of the prime schools where Pontian migrants’ children attend. It is again an interesting case where Greek-Cypriots and Pontians are co-educated in a locally driven intercultural setting.

Interviews were conducted with Principals, as well as other responsible persons of authority in developing, implementing and supervising the specific need-driven policy instruments for inter-cultural or other ‘special’ educational strategy and planning. Therefore 3 interviews were conducted with each of the school heads, 3 interviews with specially appointed persons from the ministry of education (inspectors, specialist educational psychologist, responsible officer for inter-cultural primary education, head of ‘special educational zone’). A further 3 interviews per school (i.e. a total of 9) with teachers and educationalists who had regular and direct contact and responsibility with the education of pupils in these 3 schools.

A Methodological Note

Apart from the educational experts (whom we have included in the research) we do not have any other NGOs not already included in the experts: We have included the Educational Rights Group, the organization that Pontians participate, the ISAG persons etc. As for Parent Associations, which are almost exclusively made up by primarily Greek-Cypriot parents, it would be extremely problematic to include them, as it will be shown from in the role of parents’ associations in generating a racist and xenophobic environment by insisting on moving their children away from the schools unless the numbers of migrant children are reduced. One main problem with involving parents association in the three schools under examination in the fact that no migrant or ethnic minority / community parents are actually active or involved in the association. A study involving the schools of Faneromeni and two other schools in Limassol and Pafos in 2001 was conducted on instruction of the Parents Associations

(all Cyprus) in the three cities who expressed concern over the growing numbers of migrants in Cypriot schools and how this would affect the educational attainment of Greek Cypriot pupils (see Trimikliniotis 2001). It is therefore apparent that if the aim of the project were to obtain alternative and in any case more sympathetic accounts towards migrants and ethnic communities, as this would have not occurred with interviews from parental associations.

Therefore an alternative strategy was devised: We interviewed all ‘sides’, involving at least one person from the school management (i.e. the principal and Vice –principal), figures of ‘high authority’ in policy making, an interview conducted on an educational psychologist specialist, and ordinary teachers in three schools with migrant, ethnic minorities and communities in three different towns. To supplement this information we decided conduct (a) an interview with the chair of the *Pontian and Greek Diaspora Association* to be included as an NGO person, (b) we utilize the findings of other studies (Trimikliniotis, 2001; Spyrou, 2004; Agathogleous, 2004), (c) observations, and ‘inside knowledge’ of two researchers who are also teachers in similar situations and (d) we have taken advantage of an extensive and thorough participant observation, and ethnographic accounts, by one of the researchers involved in this study, who spent 2 months paying daily visits at the 18th School of Limassol and ended up with a study (Agathogleous, 2004) as well as extensive anecdotal research notes, observations and material, to be utilized in the current study for the first time. Additionally, an attempt was also made to provide a brief contextual introduction on the school itself: its location, size, the presence of migrant and other ethnic groups, the local community, etc. Finally, as far as general policy issues are concerned, we utilized the insights from the Ministry of Education and Culture appointed specialist on primary education affairs and inter-cultural education.

1. Nicosia - Faneromeni Primary School

Introduction: The School of *Faneromeni*

The School of *Faneromeni* is situated at the heart of the old Nicosia, inside the Venetians walls. Next to the primary school one finds the Secondary school and the church of *Faneromeni* with its square where children always play. A few meters away there is a small mosque in good condition but no longer used. The area near the School is a commercial area where the pedestrianised streets of Ledra and Onasagorou end. A few meters squares away is the 'Green line'. Primarily migrant workers from different ethnic communities populate the area, but the Pontian Greeks seem to predominate.

Principal,
Educational Policy-maker (E.P)
Teachers 1, 2, 3
NGO Officer

1. What do you do?

Teachers 1, 2, 3
Principal is an educator as well.
Educational policy-maker at the Office of the Director for Primary Education
NGO, Council for Émigré Greeks; cooperate with schools and liaise on educational issues relating to the Pontian Greeks

2. [For school authorities] How long have you worked here?
[For members of organizations] How long have you been engaged in the issue of pupils with immigrant background?

The Principal is working at the school for 4 ½ years.
Teacher 1 is working at the school for 5 years.
Teachers 2 & 3 are working at school for one year and
Educational policy-maker: 4 years
NGO: Voluntary basis for 9 years

3. Would you say the school is relatively open or closed to the success of immigrants? Highly open, relatively open, relatively closed, highly closed? Explain.

Teacher 1 and the principal agreed that the school is highly open to the success of immigrants because as Teacher 1 said when "other schools, don't want these (immigrant) students they sent them to our school". The Principal considers the school as being highly open because 80 immigrants pupils are study there.

However, Teachers 2& 3 agreed that it's 'relatively open'. Teacher 2 argued that a lot of help is offered to the students regarding to their education. He said that they are responsible for their success either their immigrants or not. Teacher 3 based his answer on the fact that the school created Greek classes especially for immigrants students.

NGO: They have to accept pupils from the entire world, according to the law; therefore they are an ‘open institution’.

4. Where would you place the school in relation to most others in terms of openness to advancing immigrants? Far above average, above average, average, below average, far below average.

All for of them agreed that school in relation to most others in terms of openness to advancing immigrants is above average.

[E.P. not addressed this point but answered generally about policy in Nicosia]

5. How are pupils assessed for advancement? Is there a possibility that the assessment procedure discriminates against immigrants? Explain.

It seems that each teacher use his/ her own assessment.

Teacher 1 said that

Assessment is during the year. If someone comes in class and is a foreign language speaker (αλλόγλωσσος) and the teacher assess that he cannot cope at the specific grade the teacher will suggest that the specific child should go at a lower grade. We had cases that it happened”.

Teacher 2 said that assessment is “through written exercises, participation in class, their behaviour”.

Teacher 3 generalise the answer “It depends on the teachers and the method they use.”

Principal analysed the procedure the school follow in order to admit each child to the appropriate grade:

When the children arrive at school first issue we need to sort out is that of language. We have many reception classes. We have a teacher that speaks Russian, Georgian, as most of immigrant children come from that countries. We pay the appropriate attention, we integrate them (εντάσσουμε) they learn the language and every once and a while according to progress of each student with respect to language we decide in what grade each student should attend. We have four different levels of language. The first level deals with the admission and then it depends on the progress a student makes with respect to language.

Teacher 1 and the principal said that discrimination is taking place against immigrants during the assessment procedure. Teacher 2 &3 said that discrimination against immigrants is not taking place because the majority of the students are immigrants.

EP: As far as what is expected by the Ministry the teacher makes daily assessment and the teacher is obliged to send to the ministry an annual report. A teacher may decide that a pupil be required to repeat a year (not for primary school). No discrimination occurs.

NGO: Considers that the main difficulty migrant pupils is language, hence their lower educational attainment.

6. To what extent is language competence important in decisions? Explain.

They all find language as the most important competence.

Teacher 1 said that language is the base for communication learning. Furthermore he added that language is the criterion for teachers to decide in which grade the students should attend.

For Teacher 2 beside that that he finds language as the most important competence he also mentioned

“Because the majority of the students are immigrants we must change the way we teach as they don’t speak Greek and we cannot communicate with them. Furthermore, because they don’t speak the language they don’t participate in class and thus they create a problem in class and in school in general”.

Teacher 3 believes that language is “the element that leads to success”.

Moreover, the principal believes that because language is the most important competence is the reason why they pay more attention to language courses. He added that

“If we knew their language that would be better but unfortunately our capabilities are up to this point: Teaching them our language”.

NGO: Considers that language is the key and migrant pupils must be encouraged to learn the language.

7. What other skills and knowledge are important in your view? Do immigrants / ethnic minorities and communities fare better or worse in comparison to native pupils? Much worse? Worse? Better? Much better? Explain.

All four of them agreed that language is the most important factor. Beside language Teacher 1 gave the excuse that immigrant parents don’t have the potentiality or ability to help their children and as a result the children are left to their own devices to acquire the skills by themselves to learn.

Teacher 2 believes that beside language practical classes are very important. He therefore pointed out that language is the most important because is the tool used in all classes and without knowing language “*then they face a lot of obstacles*”.

Teacher 3 insisted on language.

The Principal believes that beside language socialize is very important. He also mentioned that children must find ways to integrated in society.

To the question whether immigrants fare better or worse in comparison to native pupils Teacher 1 gave us an example through his experience in school

“I’m working for five years at this school and I have seen children who speak different language that they are doing better than Cypriot and vice versa. There are some that because of apathy (αδιαφορία) they can’t make an addition (πρόσθεση) during a hole year but there are students that write essays in Greek much better than a Cypriot.

Teacher 2 stated, “I cannot generalise. Honestly I don’t separate. I see all students as individuals” He couldn’t rank it to worse or better.

On the other hand Teacher 3 generalise his answer by saying that

In general we can say that immigrants fare worse than Greek-Cypriots because we ignore their cultural Background. We implement an assimilationist policy (εφαρμόζουμε μια αφομοιωτική πολιτική) so we are driven to lower performance”.

However the Principal argued that ones the immigrants learn Greek language they are doing better than Greek-Cypriots.

EP: Apart from language, adaptation to the new environment and belonging /integration (ένταξη). Cannot say whether migrants or Turkish-Cypriots do better or worse, as no scientific research has been conducted but believes that “once they acquire a good command of Greek they will do just as well as our ones” («εξίσου καλά με τους δικούς μας»)

NGO: Considers that the other important skill is arithmetic because it will help them in their everyday life.

Note: Officials never refer to the term ‘assimilation’ in public. However, the Memorandum by the ministry as well as the national curriculum refers and stresses the maintaining and the cultivating of Helleno-Christian character of the education system.

8. Are there differences in resources between schools with a high proportion of pupils with immigrant / ethnic minority and community background compared to other schools?

Teacher 1 argues that their school is downgraded because parents’ main occupation is that of a worker or cleaner thus they cannot afford to offer them the necessary help for their children.

Yet, Teacher 2 argued that the economical support given to the school is more than other schools because as the teacher 1 mentioned immigrant parents don’t have the economic availability to pay for 2-day trips.

Teacher 3 mentioned that economic support given to schools depends on the size of each school in respect to the number of students.

The principal said that the ministry is offering, “*as much as they allow to*”. Alternatively the parents union is offering as much as they ask for. He therefore added that “native parents pay; they are the ones giving the money. On the other hand the immigrants are those who ask and they want more activities”. He also mentioned that he asked from immigrant parents to join the parents union but no one ever did and assumes that is because they don’t have the time.

EP: No this does not happen; but additional funds may be provided on the basis of local needs.

NGO: Not aware of this.

9. How does school segregation affect the quality of education in the segregated schools?

Principal, Teachers 1 and 2 argued that there segregation is not taking place therefore it doesn't affect the quality of education. While Teacher 1 said that it doesn't affect the quality of education because the majority of the students are immigrants.

EP: This is matter that is dealt with what is called 'Zones of Educational Priority' (ZEP), whose philosophy is to give to those who have less, to respond to the local needs.

NGO: Has not noticed such policy emerging.

10. Are there teachers with immigrant / ethnic minority and community background who work in your school? In the school system in this city?

They all said that there is a female educator but the ministry did not appoint her. The Parents Union is paying her and she took over the admission (language) classes. The principal mentioned that she is "the connective link between immigrant parents and school".

On the question of whether they know any immigrant teachers working in other schools Teacher 3 & 2 said that they don't know, the principal said that there are in 2 or 3 schools and Teacher 1 said in some schools.

EP: They must be citizens of the Republic of Cyprus; with accession the law has changed to allow also Europeans

NGO: Only one support teacher in the afternoon

11. How much interest does the school have in recruiting teachers with immigrants / ethnic minority and community background?

Teacher 2 said that he doesn't know whether the school wants to recruit any immigrant teachers.

Teacher 1 argued,

"Our school tried a lot of times to recruit immigrant teachers but the ministry denied".

The principal stated, "The school wants to recruit such teachers, but it's not our decision".

Teacher 3 pointed out that "It's not schools' decision but the school is interested".

EP: This is matter that is dealt with what is called 'Zones of Educational Priority'. He added that the ministry may propose such matters to the relevant council and there is willingness on the part of the Ministry to do such reforms concerning the employment of other than E.U. or Cypriot citizens.

[Note: There is here perhaps the issue that the teachers' unions will object to such a reform.]

NGO: Considers that this is an issue for the ministry and the school would be interested. He added:

The Ministry says that it is interested in tackling racism and xenophobia, but I don't see any practice.

12. Are their differences in pay scales and career opportunities when one compares

teachers with immigrants / ethnic minority and community background to native teachers?

The principal made a comment on teachers that “they are free people and don’t rely on stereotypes”. Teacher 1 referred to people working for ZEP and he said that it depends on the individual but people working for ZEP are great people. Teacher 2 referred to people working for ZEP and said that there are “No negative stereotypes. There are some positive stereotypes that these students behaviour is more appropriate than our children (Cypriots)”. Teacher 3 he doesn’t know.

19. Do pupils with immigrants / ethnic minorities and communities background have in your view realistic opportunities to enter the university (or other institution of higher education). Explain the answer.

The principal don’t know if immigrant students will manage to go to university. Teacher 3 said that on hand it depends on the individual (students) and on the other on the system that has to “find ways to maximise the opportunities for children in all levels”.

Teacher 2 said that immigrant students could make it to the university as long as they learn the language.

Teacher 1 mentioned that some immigrant student he knows that now are at high school they can go to university if they stay in Cyprus.

20. Do those with immigrants / ethnic minorities and communities background and natives [nationality] have equal opportunities to obtain stipendiums and study-loans? Put another way, is nationality a significant factor when it comes to obtaining a stipendium?

When it concerns stipendiums and loans teacher 1 said that immigrant students are being supported economically but he doesn’t know if they can receive any stipendiums and if nationality, or ethnicity play a significant role. Teacher2 doesn’t know.

Teacher 3 stated, “As far as I know Greek universities or university of Cyprus nationality play a significant factor. For other countries I am not sure”.

The principal mentioned that he doesn’t know but “I feel that Cypriots will have an advantage”.

21. Do you have observations or reflections about how “the other” (the non-[nationality]) is presented in your schoolbooks and in classroom discourses? Explain. Give example.

Teacher 1 states that

“School books are 20 years old. The problem of migration is not so old. I don’t think that one knew 20 years ago that in Cyprus in some schools there will be foreigners students. We as school, because we

are facing the problem, we brought our own books in order to help students that speak different language”.

Teacher 2 states that

“The schoolbooks are not objective but through classroom discourses we are trying to teach students that we are all equal. Anyway we don’t use schoolbooks that much. For example we don’t use history books because in that book there are a lot of negative stereotypes against Turkish and these students cannot understand it because it’s not their history. We promote humanism”.

Teacher 3 states

“Assumptions against Turkish are been made e.g. enemies, barbarians and on the other hand the Europeans are the civilised, this assumptions can enter the unconscious. Teachers must detect these elements. The teacher has the obligation to discuss them with children and fight the stereotypes”.

The principal states:

We don’t pay attention any more to these kinds of stereotypes that most of our books present. We are trying to create another world through our discussions, that all are equal.

I cannot give an answer for our schoolbooks. Through classroom discourses we are trying to create another world that we must respect the differences”.

2. Limassol -18th Primary School

Introduction: The School of Ayios Antonios

The 18th School of Ayios Antonios is situated in the Turkish sector of the city of Limassol. This is the historic area most Turkish-Cypriots used to reside; today is a poor and deprived area distinctly lacking any cultural and entertainment traits. This is where Greek-Cypriot refugees from the northern occupied territories reside, most of whom are over the ages of 45⁵. From the beginning of year 2004 a number of Turkish-Cypriots and Romas reside there: 10 Turkish-Cypriot families with 28 children and 53 families of Roma with 119 children; to total Roma population is about 225 persons.

During the year 2003-4 there were 45 Roma enrolments (out of the total number of 67 children of schooling age) only 5 have moved to other schools. During the year 2002 – 03 out of 176 total number of pupils, 11 were migrant children from Iraq, Pakistan, Georgia, Ukraine, two Kurds and two Pontian Greeks from Russia and a further 29 were Cypriot Roma children.

The 18th Primary school is an old building in bad shape – in desperate need for restoration. The technology room has a dual role as it also hosts the non-Greek native speakers during the Modern Greek lesson (not for the current year). The school does not have a covered playground, nor does it have a multi-usage room. Many times primary school children would bump into the older secondary school children, who share the playground – the secondary school is the neighbouring building. In rainy days children are forced to stay in their classes during their breaks, whilst the teachers insist they move out of the class for the room get clear air.

Methodological Note: For the 18th School there were five interviews conducted and additional ‘un-official’ interviews, comments and meetings to clarify matters with the interviewees and other teachers who declined to be recorded but were happy to share some insights with the researchers.

Question reports

1. What do you do?

School Authority:

1.Principal,

2.Educator/ Educational Psychologist (Ed. Psy)

3. Turkologist

4. Teacher

5. ZEP Teacher (ZEP)

2. [For school authorities] How long have you worked here?

[For members of organizations] How long have you been engaged in the issue of pupils with immigrant background?

Principal: 4 years

Ed. Psy: 5 years

Teacher: 7 months

Turkologist: 6 months

ZEP: 2 years

The principal in private complained that although the Ministry started acting on the matter over the last 3 years, it does not send any mature teachers, only newly appointed ones.

3. Would you say the school is relatively open or closed to the success of immigrants? Highly open, relatively open, relatively closed, highly closed? Explain.

School Authority:

The principal and the educator seemed to agree that the school is highly open towards immigrant and T/C students. They supported their argument by saying that minister sent a Turkologist for communication purposes and an educator who will teach these children Greek.

The principal pointed out that they face a lot of problems with gypsies because they are not discipline (they hit and insult in each other) and as a result they make their education more difficult.

“Of course this could happen with our children (G/C) but not at the same point”.

Furthermore the teacher said that he considers the school highly open because they offer free lunch to gypsies.

The Turkologist said that the school is relatively open to immigrants because the school accepts children with different ethnic background. Nevertheless, the same person in an ‘informal’ interview (i.e. when she was not recorded) she complained that she does not know her role and that she was never given a specific task:

I come here and I don’t what to do.

4. Where would you place the school in relation to most others in terms of openness to advancing immigrants? Far above average, above average, average, below average, far below average.

The Teacher said that the school in terms of openness to advancing immigrants is above average because is the only school that has more than 67 students that speak different language (allofonous)

The principal said that school is above average in terms of openness to advancing immigrants and gypsies but on the other hand it created some problems because G/C parents reacted very negative to the fact that T/C gypsies students will study at this school:

“Many G/C reacted very negatively to the fact that T/C will study at this school because gypsies’ children have something violent attached to their character”

She therefore mentioned that 25 G/C students left the school because of the above. Another reason that the principal find the school above average in terms of openness to advancing immigrants and gypsies is because they offer free lunch to them and also because the school is part of the zone of educational priority (ZEP)

The Turkologist said that school in terms of openness to advancing immigrants is average.

5. How are pupils assessed for advancement? Is there a possibility that the assessment procedure discriminates against immigrants? Explain.

The Turkologist said that school assessment is average ranking though she never assesses pupils. She therefore mentioned that she doesn't know how teachers assess children: "I don't know exactly how the teachers assessed pupils". The Turkologist mentioned that assessment takes place through tests but the principal said that the directions she had from the ministry is to write down the work that has been done from the beginning of the year to the end and compare their improvement through year. According to the principal the reports are given to the ministry at the end of the year.

When they were asked if discrimination is taking place through the assessment procedure they all answered negative.

Teacher: "No I don't think so. Discrimination is not taking place against them"

Turkologist said, "No discrimination is taking place through the assessment procedure"

However, the principal pointed out that discrimination is not taking place through assessment procedure but it's the system that can discriminate. "No discrimination against these children. I believe is the system. Although the ministry helped us a lot we all see with disappointment that the results are not what we all expected".

Moreover, the principal seemed worried that children cannot integrate in school system:

"A lot of gypsies learned to read and write but up to a point. What puzzles us is that they don't integrate. They don't feel that this school has rules, which they have to obey".

ZEP Teacher

Those migrant pupils who show an interest are encouraged and supported from teachers, in comparison to others such as the Roma who do not. Discrimination does occur and is systemically derived. This applies particularly to Roma and not to migrant pupils who are integrated smoothly, he says.

6. To what extent is language competence important in decisions? Explain.

All agree that language is an important competence in general. They argue that learning Greek is an advantage because students can understand their lessons therefore be better students.

One of teachers mentioned that most gypsies don't know to speak Greek and therefore he cannot communicate with them. However, according to the specific teacher, some children "can communicate up to a tolerable stage and some at a satisfying stage" for example "they can go to the canteen and buy their sandwich, or ask permission to go to the toilet, to drink water".

The principal believes that not only T/C gypsies face the problem of communication but also the G/C because of their economic background. She mentioned that both groups deprived a lot of things and that T/C parents physically abuse their children.

Moreover, the principal pointed out that some problems are gender related,

“They don’t respect women and that comes clearly at school because they don’t obey us (women) but if a man (teacher) tells them something they obey”.

The ZEP teacher pointed out that the language issue can only be resolved via socialisation the Greek-Cypriot children.

Only Greek education is being offered, when they ought to be taught their own mother tongue

7. What other skills and knowledge are important in your view? Do immigrants / ethnic minorities and communities fare better or worse in comparison to native pupils? Much worse? Worse? Better? Much better? Explain.

T1 and the Turkologist agreed that the most important skill is language. Turkish language teacher said that any other skill is just an extra qualification but once one learns the language he can do anything.

The principal on the other hand stressed out that T/C should do more practical classes as crafts, planting or computers but not because they are good at it but because they sit quiet and they enjoy it

“If they sit in the computer room all day, they are quiet and they enjoy what they do. They also like being outside in the garden and planting and they like art lesson. They like practical classes more than theoretical”.

Furthermore, the principal mentioned that gypsies have their own rules in their lives because they sleep in the river or in cars but T/C are much better than them (gypsies) and she gave the example of a young T/C girl that she doing at school to the point that one cannot distinguish her from “our” children (G/C).

When the participants were asked if immigrants, Gypsies or T/C fare better in comparison to natives the principal pointed out that “*Children from mixed marriages, migrants, yes. Gypsies have no chance*”. Turkish language teacher on the other hand said that it depends on the individual and if T/C and gypsies manage to integrate within the educational system. For her it doesn’t make a difference if one is native or not but what matters is to learn the language. Last, the teacher said that there are T/C and that are good and he gave the example of a boy who is “amazing” but gypsies’ “knowledge level is very low”.

8. Are there differences in resources between schools with a high proportion of pupils with immigrant / ethnic minority and community background compared to other schools?

The teacher said that he doesn’t know if there are differences in resources between schools with a high proportion of pupils with immigrant background compared to other schools, Turkish language teacher thinks yes. The principal didn’t understand the question at the beginning and she said

“Parents that coming from any other country can find a job because they like working. Gypsies on the other hand have the disadvantage (μειονέκτημα) that they don’t want to work. They are on welfare invoke (επικαλούμενοι) sickness but on the other hand I believe that a face of racism appears when Cypriots do not accept to employ gypsies. Cypriots don’t trust them therefore gypsies are unemployed”

When the question was repeated she said that government could help more. Teaching support in ZEP is provided according to the number of migrants who language is not Greek (e.g. for every 5 such persons 3 hours on language).

9. How does school segregation affect the quality of education in the segregated schools?

Turkish language teacher said that segregation can affect the quality of education in great extent especially the G/C. On the other hand the teacher said that no segregation is taking place especially within their own school because the teachers try to educate G/C and T/C to coexist and he gave the example he gave was that when it comes group working, teachers mix the groups with T/C and G/C. However, the teacher blamed the T/C gypsies saying, “These students (gypsies T/C) cannot stay in class more than ten minutes. It affects the quality of education to the worst of course. The students (gypsies T/C) are upset all the time. They refuse to enter the class and they fight all the time. It’s a desperate situation (απελπιστική η κατάσταση).”

The principal pointed out that segregation exist because of “our ethnic problem” the Cyprus problem. She gave the example of G/C students gathering together shouting to T/C “*Turks out of Cyprus*”, blaming the parents of G/C that these ideas come from their domestic environment. She therefore mentioned that: “There is always the fear of the different” but on the other hand through her experience she notices that the G/C can accept other students from other ethnic backgrounds as Russians, Pakistanis or Pontians.

10. Are there teachers with immigrant / ethnic minority and community background who work in your school? In the school system in this city?

All three of the said that there is a Turkish language teacher in their school that her father is Syrian. There are no teachers from immigrant background.

11. How much interest does the school have in recruiting teachers with immigrants / ethnic minority and community background?

The three of them said that we should ask the ministry but the principal added that they need to recruit T/C man because “he will know the culture and he can make T/C obey and they will respect him”. It is not up to School but up to the ministry; the principal stated that would have liked to see this happening.

12. Are their differences in pay scales and career opportunities when one compares teachers with immigrants / ethnic minority and community background to native teachers?

None of the three know if there *are differences in* pay scales and career opportunities when one compares teachers with immigrant background to native teachers as there are no immigrants working there.

13. The teacher said that there are differences in school performance because their (T/C) education level is lower.

Turkologist said that there are differences and she didn't want to expand the answer and the principal blamed T/C families. She said, "If their (Gypsies T/C) parents are educated, working or if they have a "family spirit" children could perform better". Furthermore, the principal mentioned that school differences exist because children are coming from different backgrounds and experiences.

On the question on how many pupils finish their education between those with immigrants' background or T/C and G/C the teacher mentioned that he knows cases were T/C gypsies register at school but they never attend. Turkish language teacher and the principal said that some never finish school.

When the participants were asked if there are any differences in school performance as a whole between schools with a large proportion of pupils with immigrant backgrounds compared with other schools the teacher and Turkish language teacher said yes.

On the other hand, according to the principal there are some children that are so good students that one cannot tell the difference between G/C, T/C and immigrants.

AEP Teacher, Ed.Psych: there are obvious differentials; main reason is non-regular attendance.

14. Is there program-separation, with a more advanced, theoretical program, typically leading to university studies and a more practical program, from which it is difficult to gain entry to the University? Are pupils with immigrant background over represented in practical programs and underrepresented in theoretical programs? If yes, what are the effects for pupils with immigrant background?

On the question the three teachers of them said that it's an early stage to know because it's an elementary school. ZEP argued that there is no difference in the program since all students are guided toward a university education and that differences among G/C students and foreign speaking one are due to the fact that foreign speakers prefer the practical field of education e.g. maths and physics.

15. Are there cases where parents of immigrants / ethnic minorities and communities background have accused this school of discriminating? Other schools in the city?

Turkish language teacher said that there are some accusations of discrimination against gypsies but she didn't want to expand on the issue. On the other hand the teacher said that there were a lot of accusations not for discrimination but because of the fighting that are taking place between the gypsies but the principal said she never heard any accusations except from some G/C parents that she, the principal, "drag (koubalo) them" at the specific school. She added that there is a feeling of insecurity among Romas students who due to their small number they feel as being a minority.

ZEP said that there have been no accusations made by immigrants about discrimination. To the contrary G/C protest that teachers over-protect migrants.

16. Have the complaints been organized ? Have NGOs been involved?

On the question of there were organized complains or if NGO's were involved they all said no.

17. Are there particular key persons (gatekeepers) in the school who play a key role in pupils' educational choices? Explain.

The teacher and Turkish language teacher said that the key people in school are people from ZEP (ζώνη εκπαιδευτικής προτεραιότητας) that affect the education of the children by giving suggestions to the Ministry on the improvement of education. The principal, find that the key people are the two tourkologoi because the children are attached to them.

18. To what extent is it the case that these "gatekeepers" might rely on stereotypes (with respect to pupils with immigrants / ethnic minorities and communities background)? If yes, what stereotypes. Do you have an explanation of why they are used?

The teacher because he is himself a member of ZEP who teaches Greek said: "Personally I don't rely on stereotypes but I can judge through facts. I can say that some students are lazy but I don't judge because of ones background" The principal said that none rely on stereotypes while Turkish language teacher pointed out: "I think that unconsciously they do have some stereotypes against the T/C but they keep them for themselves, though some things are given. For e.g. that because they are gypsies they are lazy. They know it but they don't express it".

19. Do pupils with immigrants / ethnic minorities and communities background have in your view realistic opportunities to enter the university (or other institution of higher education). Explain the answer.

On the question if pupils with immigrant background have opportunities to enter the university or other institution of higher education the teacher said, "I think no. I just believe that they can't make it". The principal said that she doesn't know and Turkish language teacher believed they do have opportunities to enter university. ZEP said that there are slight opportunities.

20. Do those with immigrants / ethnic minorities and communities background and natives [nationality] have equal opportunities to obtain stipendiums and study-loans? Put in another way, is nationality a significant factor when it comes to obtaining a stipendium?

If the students with immigrant background and natives have equal opportunities to obtain stipendiums and study-loans the teacher said that he doesn't know if nationality is a significant factor. The principal said that Cypriots citizens can obtain stipendiums

and study loans but when she was asked if nationality is a significant factor to obtain stipendiums or study loan she said that we should ask the ministry.

Turkish language teacher said that she is not sure If they all can have equal opportunities and then she added that she thinks that all can have equal opportunities and when she asked if nationality plays a significant factor to obtain stipendiums or study loan she said: “Yes nationality can influence”.

21. Do you have observations or reflections about how “the other” (the non-[nationality]) is presented in your schoolbooks and in classroom discourses? Explain. Give example.

The teacher pointed out that

“Our schoolbooks are ethnocentric. They underrepresented Turks but this is not intentional. These are Greek schools and are obvious that they support Greeks and their history. The problem with T/C is something new for our schools. I don’t know if the ministry decides to change the books. Because of this, during history and religion (θησκευτικά) class they have the right to attend Turkish language or something else”.

The principal avoided the question saying that

There a lot of readings that tries to bring together children with different children. We have created an atmosphere of a colourful school. You notice the walls (painted with different children around the globe) through this we are trying to give a message that we are equal.

Last Turkish language teacher avoided the question by giving us an example

Some G/C have perceptions against foreigners because of their parents. What their parents believe comes through children and a lot of times G/C downgrade foreigners.

ZEP said that books are not based to multicultural education meaning that they have no reference to the other.

3. Fourth Primary School of Paphos

Introduction: The 4th Primary School

The 4th Primary School is located near the centre of the city of Paphos, in an area that has become over the last fifteen years an area of high concentration of Pontian Greeks. The district is poor and if one wanders in the street one can see a lot of young men with little to sitting around, drinking smoking and chatting on the pavements.

The school itself has a large number of migrant pupils, up to 50%, i.e. out of the 270 pupils in the school 135 are migrant children from Georgia, Russia and the Ukraine, by and large Pontian children whose parents came to Cyprus from the former Soviet Union, mostly via Greece. The age break-down is 30 migrant pupils in grade A, 17 in grade B, 18 in grade C, 15 in grade D, 17 in grade E, 22 in grade F.

School principal, School inspector
Three teachers

1. What do you do?

School principal, Teachers 1, 2, 3= T1, T2, T3

School inspector

2. [For school authorities] How long have you worked here?

SP: 1 year in this school

T: 1 year

Inspector: 7 years

[For members of organizations] How long have you been engaged in the issue of pupils with immigrant background?

3. Would you say the school is relatively open or closed to the success of immigrants?

Highly open, relatively open, relatively closed, highly closed? Explain.

All agree the principal; the inspector and the teachers agree that school is very open towards the success of the migrants. In this specific school children are assisted both on individual and a group basis. A 15-person group was created and a teacher was appointed to work with this group exclusively.

4. Where would you place the school in relation to most others in terms of openness to advancing immigrants? Far above average, above average, average, below average, far below average.

The principal and the teachers consider school to be far above average in terms of openness to advancing immigrants.

5. How are pupils assessed for advancement? Is there a possibility that the assessment procedure discriminates against immigrants? Explain.

They receive the same assessment tests that G/C pupils receive. The teachers consider that in this way immigrant children are treated equally with GC children. A teacher said: “they are assessed in the same way as the rest of the children. We treat them the same way and I don’t think that they get the impression that we consider them inferior”.

6. To what extent is language competence important in decisions? Explain.

The teachers consider language to be crucial, since they attend a Greek school, both for their academic career and their social life in school. They usually succeed in maths and have lower grades in language. The principal points out that there may be some discipline problems, due to their inability to understand what is happening in the classroom. She also said that it is very important for the children to attend school from the beginning of the school year. Some migrant pupils would begin their school in the middle of the year and this creates additional problems of adaptation to the new school environment etc.

7. What other skills and knowledge are important in your view? Do immigrants fare better or worse in comparison to native pupils? Much worse? Worse? Better? Much better? Explain.

The teachers referred to language as the most important skill. They also think that co-operation and other communication skills are very important, since this method is applied in the class. A teacher said that Pontians are “very competitive” and have difficulties when working in a group, even when this group is consisted of Pontians alone. She considered that Pontian parents bring up their children to be competitive so that to survive in an environment where they will be a minority. He explained this by saying: It may be part of the protective measures of the family; perhaps they are trying to cultivated a powerful self – image so that they are prepared and are not later injured in a school where they are in the minority.

8. Are there differences in resources between schools with a high proportion of pupils with immigrant background compared to other schools?

The only difference that both teachers and principal mention is the fact that schools with immigrant children have more financial support. This entails more teachers. The principal considers the decrease of the number of students in each class to be more effective, especially in those schools where 50%, 60% or even 70% are foreigners.

[Note: This is perhaps better addressed to policy-makers, NGO’s and experts rather than school teacher themselves because unless there due gross inequalities of resources and facilities or unless it has become matter or public controversy they are unlikely to be aware of this issue.]

9. How does school segregation affect the quality of education in the segregated schools?

10. Are there teachers with immigrant / and ethnic minority and community background who work in your school? In the school system in this city?

No there aren't.

11. How much interest does the school have in recruiting teachers with immigrant / ethnic background?

A teacher referred to an incident as an example of how authorities face the possibility of recruiting immigrant teachers in her opinion: "A girl from Georgia came to our school for a placement week and the principal exclaimed 'they come in our schools now, this is just what we need...they come here they get educated and they will eventually take our jobs'⁶. Another teacher pointed out that there is a large number of Cypriot teachers who are not yet employed in schools, so the recruitment of teachers with immigrant background will make the problem even bigger. However, they were in favour of such a possibility, but they believe that teachers with immigrant background will face a lot of problems in Greek Cypriot schools. "If they ever get employed in schools I think they will definitely be discriminated in some phase of their career either from the parents or the principals. I know how Greek Cypriot parents think and I believe that they will ask for their children to be transferred to another class so that they won't have a foreigner teacher. The principals may refuse to give them a class etc. Taking in mind the Cypriot way of thinking I believe they will be discriminated".

Inspector considers the appointment of teachers with immigrant background to be helpful for the children. "I consider that it would be good for them. If there was even one who spoke their language or do their things, a small play perhaps or dance."

[Comment: Note (a) how the question is understood here i.e. merely as a pedagogical issue, not as an issue of fundamental human rights of pupils and teachers alike not to be discriminated (b) Note also how there is an immediate assumption of a specific role which is that of 'doing their little things' sort of things. How knowledge, experience, skills and ability is belittled, ethnicised and racialised, not as one of equal value, of additional insight etc. on an equal footing but a little thing that would be entertaining for pupils. Immediately one is able perceive the kind of inter – or multicultural, on integration model envisaged: You immigrant / ethnic teachers will be helpful, useful in the racialised division of labour: You do your "little thing" and we provide sound, universal and positive knowledge and skill.

12. Are their differences in the pay scales and career opportunities when one compares teachers with immigrant / ethnic minority and community background to native teachers?

No immigrants are employed as teachers in public education and no Turkish – Cypriots. As for the three constitutional recognised 'religious groups' they are part of

the Greek Cypriot community and are thus given all the opportunities that Greek Cypriots have.

13. Are their differences in school performance and how many pupils finish their education between pupils with immigrant background others? Are there differences in school performance as a whole between schools with a large proportion of pupils with immigrant backgrounds compared with other schools?

Significant differences in their school performance were not noticed, though they are generally considered to be better in maths. They are also good in music and dancing. A teacher said that their school performance would be better if they studied harder at home and that differences in performance between immigrants and natives arise from this point.

They all finish their education, with rare exceptions, but as stressed out both by teachers and the principal their attendance is not complete since they are usually absent from school. "A lot of them leave for a lot of time. For instance there were elections in Greece and they went there for three weeks. Or they may come to school only on Fridays for no particular reason. This was often. There were those who came to school after Christmas or after Easter, or were absent from Christmas until Easter. I don't know if we can call this regular attendance..."

As far as the school's performance as a whole is concerned, teachers think that the presence of immigrant children is not effective and they think that their school's performance would be the same with or without any immigrant students. The principal though has a different opinion since another school in the centre of Pafos, where only Greek Cypriot children who come from wealthy and highly educated families, has higher performance. "The presence of immigrant children is one of the reasons for a school's low performance. When a teacher is in a class where 50% of his students don't understand what he says because they don't know the language then you cannot expect high results."

14. Is there program-separation, with a more advanced, theoretical program, typically leading to university studies and a more practical program, from which it is difficult to gain entry to the University? Are pupils with immigrant background over-represented in practical programs and underrepresented in theoretical programs? If yes, what are the effects for pupils with immigrant background?

There isn't such a program-separation in primary education. This separation is found in secondary education, where teachers think that migrants are over-represented in the practical program. As a result most migrants occupy manual jobs so the stereotypes (foreigners can only handle manual jobs) are re-enforced. One of the teachers believes

that this is a phenomenon that will eventually cease to exist because the new generation will be born in Cyprus and will completely be assimilated in the society.

T1: In a naïve ‘march-for-progress’ optimism present a rosy picture where migrants will be assimilated in the Cypriot context: The generation we now have at schools is not necessarily over represented in practical direction.

They can choose what they like and study whatever they want. I believe that as time gets by things will be getting better and better. They will be born in Cyprus and will be Cypriots who dimply know that their father for instance or grandfather was born in Russia; they want feel

The principal said that there isn’t such a separation in primary schools. “However the Ministry instructed that time for the extra-help provided to them cannot be taken from music, gymnastics or art. We want them to take part in these classes, these children want gymnastics, they want music”

The school inspector said that there are no problems from the school children themselves but from some parents:

“There are some instances of school parents or parents associations that they are under the impression that if there are migrants in the class the standards of education will drop and consider it as a drawback for the education of their children. They say that they are not racist – but then again why should there be 87 Pontians in one school and only 17 in another”.

15. Are there cases where parents of immigrant background have accused this school of discriminating? Other schools in the city?

No cases were reported. At this point a teacher said that it is more often for Greek Cypriots to complain rather than immigrants.

‘They don’t want their children to sit with foreigners. They come to school just to ask me to place them elsewhere.’

16. Have the complaints been organised? Have NGOs been involved?

No.

17. Are there particular key persons (gatekeepers) in the school who play a key role in pupils’ educational choices? Explain.

There are not any key persons in primary education. The teacher is the one who advises children and effects on their educational choices.

18. To what extent is it the case that these “gatekeepers” might rely on stereotypes (with respect to pupils with immigrant background)? If yes, what stereotypes. Do you have an explanation of why they are used?

There are stereotypes most of them regarding their behaviour and their discipline. They are considered to be aggressive and fight a lot. Teachers admit that they were prejudiced before coming to this school. “I used to believe that Pontians are only good for manual jobs: builders, plasters, waiters and hotel room service providers⁷.”

However, their experience in this school changed their conceptions since everyday life proved the stereotypes wrong. “We heard a lot of things in the beginning before we got the chance to get to know these children, and had a conception already constructed which eventually changed. We’ll forward this new positive image. I can only say good things about them...” However the teachers seem to justify the existence of stereotypes considering that they are created through experience. “If you are prejudiced or if you have stereotypes it is because you’ve seen something. It can’t be done without a reason. I’ve observed some things in my class that justify the stereotypes. I cannot generalize it though and say that they are all alike.” Or in another case: “I think that older teachers are justified to have these stereotypes because when I talked to them they mentioned that children are better now. They had students they couldn’t handle; they had a lot of problems with them so these stereotypes were created and still affects them”

19. Do pupils with immigrant background have in your view realistic opportunities to enter the university (or other institution of higher education)? Explain the answer.

Everybody agrees that children with immigrant background have the same opportunities to enter higher education.

20. Do those with immigrant background and natives [nationality] have equal opportunities to obtain stipendiums and study-loans? Put another way, is nationality a significant factor when it comes to obtaining a stipendium?

Teachers think that it is harder for immigrants to obtain loans because there are not trusted by banks.

21. Do you have observations or reflections about how “the other” (the non-[nationality]) is presented in your schoolbooks and in classroom discourses? Explain. Give example.

Teacher1: referred to a text in the 3rd year which illustrates how other children pick on young boy at school and points out that there are children who are “very prejudiced” due to their parental upbringing. Example: When talking about the importance of cleanliness of the playground on Greek-Cypriot girls said that it is dirty because “these Pontians who make things dirty”.

Teacher 2: “The text books are badly outdated. I haven’t noticed anything particularly striking. Our education Helleno-centric and rightly so; not everything should be globalised. From the moment we are in a country and we want to transmit certain values, how else can we do it? Then the children will be lost and it will be chaos. Those who come must know that they will acquire certain values from the country they emigrate to. Lets not overdo it by suggesting in our textbooks that that all that is negative is what the others have or do, but we must retain in the textbooks the Helleno-central elements and an ideology of tolerance for others. There is a measure for all

Teacher 3 referred to how things were different in his time, when everything was learned exclusively by books and discovered later that things were different. When he

went to Egypt we was surprised to see Egyptians very different from what he anticipate or that not all Italians eat spaghetti and added:

In the classroom I noticed some petty arguments but in general they get on well.

Another teacher who decided to remain nameless exclaimed:

“I get very upset when I go my class to teach the same textbook that I learned at school twenty years ago... I still remember what my own teacher said when I was doing the same very lesson...every year they tell us that the textbook will change but they never do”

Note: From the subsequent conversation with the teachers the researcher realized how these teacher had never before questioned the content of the textbooks and how limited experience, knowledge they have as regards other cultures and what it means to be teaching in multicultural environment.

Task 4: Key Observations and Conclusions

(1) Identify and describe institutional Patterns

From the 4 sources of information (3 areas of study – workplace, labour market, schools and the experts) one is able to gain an insight into the operation of daily racism and how this is perceived and articulated by various ‘actors’ in society. Of course for a full understanding and appreciation of the complex and deeply – rooted dimensions of racial discrimination as institutionalised patterns of social patterns of social behaviours, other sources of information references and other methodologies would best supplement the interview – based research in WP4.

From the various Reports one is able to locate multiple levels, manifestation and dimensions of racial discrimination. Structural or systemic discrimination is easily demonstrated via the interviews and the reports written; yet few from the actors in the labour market, work place or education field actually admit it. Experts coming from different perspectives and fields of life gave the picture without fear or vested interests.

(2) Institutionalised power and Authority

When examining the three fields of the study with their sub-categories (a) Labour market mediators (public and private) (b) Work places (public and private) and (c) education (at different levels, public and private) one can identify a systemic problem which can be seen generic discrimination. This *systemic* or *generic discrimination* against marginalized ethnic groups (migrants, Roma, Turkish-Cypriot workers who

reside in the south)⁴ must be then contextually located in the specific ways discrimination is manifested at different levels of analysis. (a) It can be located as an *articulated discourse of exclusion* or (b) as an institutional mechanism which produces discriminatory patterns, or (c) individual strategies within which careers are advanced or blocked. The highly particulars and even personal experience where structure meets agency, where institution meets the citizens and non-citizens where policy meets specific implementation, where declared goals meet social praxis.

To what extent then is the ‘institutional gatekeeper’ *an independent, free floating and autonomous factor*, whose own prejudices, biases, subjective perception, goals and agenda are capable of including, or excluding the marginalized racialised ‘other’? Conversely, to what extent is the ‘gatekeeper’ only ‘relatively autonomous’ and ‘structurally bound’ as a *‘träger’* (in German) or *‘carrier’* of what is more or less a ‘given’ or ‘structurally framed set of alternatives’ in determining *‘who is in’* and *‘who is out’* in the various modes of social exchange, communication, production and reproduction?

To what extent in the ‘knowledge’ possessed by gatekeeper with role of ‘guarding’ enhance, a-la Kafkaesque, to the nebulous social mode of ‘belonging’, which is *soaked* and *enmeshed* in power-structures in society? To what extent is there room for ‘manoeuvre’, for social action in a world so *enmeshed in ideology* – where the ‘real’, the ‘symbolic’, the ‘ideological’, the ‘fantastic’ are all products of contest, negotiation and socially determined and whose boundaries are contested?

(3) Indication of bias among gatekeepers and defines of situation

At the heart of the extent to which ‘bias’ and liberal ideal which promotes with vigour ‘rules against bias’, ‘natural justice’, ‘due process’, ‘procedural justice’ and ‘fair play’ lies a fundamental debate over who is at the end of the day the ‘real’ carrier of power; who is in charge and what can be done about it. So when we are referring to the issue of ‘racial discrimination’ in whatever shape or form the debate is fundamentally one of whether it is the ‘individual’ who is endowed with ‘freedom of choice’ (this God – given or nature – given fundamental human quality and good) to act and determine the future or it a systemic, structural and social who determine matters. At the one extreme there are those who would theorise, on that I would call the individualistic or atomistic perspective, crudely described as the bad apple theorem where policy is to be directed at enlightening, educating and reforming individuals and punishing those individuals responsible. At the other extreme is the ‘total structure’ theory. No less there is radical and complete transformation of the structures of power, social relation nothing will change⁸.

(4) Indications of bias among gatekeepers and “definers of the situation.”

⁴ In the Turkish controlled north the marginal groups are poor Anatolian settlers who have arrived very recently in search for work, the Romas and Greek Cypriot so-called “enclaved” who live in Karpasia / Karpas peninsula. This would be an interesting area of study particularly if it takes the fact of detailed disinterment of the intractable Cyprus problem and takes a comparative dimension with the south.

Clearly there is a great deal of bias coming out of ‘gatekeepers’: the absence or the not so understood importance of ‘political correctness’ allows us to ‘benefit’ from the ‘candour’ and naivety of persons in public office and authority. Hence we find persons freely admitting what they believe, many times this is clearly directly discriminating against migrant and other ethnic groups.

(5) Types and uses of Stereotypes. The project should identify the use of stereotypes among gatekeepers of immigrants, all of who play a major role and have a substantial responsibility for processes of definition, stigmatisation and exclusion/inclusion of immigrants in labour markets, workplaces, and educational systems. Assessment of the extent of their use and explanation about their use.

(6) Legal constraints

(7) Complex rule systems. Institutions are complex rule systems that are difficult and slow to change. Change is typically incremental and inconsistent. Changes must be discussed and analysed. New rules formulated are typically compromises. So, even new pressures and policies do not readily translate into substantial changes in institutional functioning (such institutional inertia operates also in response to a politically changed climate supporting anti-immigrant policies).

(8) Stability and instability factors. There may be considerable openness to new non-discriminatory policy proposals and programs as long as they do not “rock the boat,” disturbing institutional functioning and authority. Informally, employers and their managers prefer to recruit “culturally competent” and “reliable” employees, especially in sensitive jobs dealing with the public or in key policy or legal areas.

(9) Other – not necessarily opposing – values and interests. Powerful groups and interests – even if not racist or xenophobic – have their own agendas and programs to which they give priority over systematic reduction of discriminatory policies and practices.

(10) Multiple and countervailing rule systems. Therefore, even with successful *formal* changes in an institution establishing non-discriminatory policies and principles, there are or emerge informal rules and practices based in some cases on deep cultural understandings and values pervading the institution as well as society in contradictory or opposing ways. For instance, everyday classification and interpretative schemes typically operate in a discriminatory manner. The term “immigrant” (both its formal and informal expressions) serves to maintain and reproduce certain discriminatory concepts and practices, for instance those conducted in a paternalistic fashion that “clientizes” immigrants.

Report of the Public Workplace in Nicosia

Background

The public workplace chosen in Nicosia is the police Headquarters. The Cyprus Police force has 4099 members, including 683 Regular Special and Special officers in different positions of rank. The current force was set up during the British colonial times, but the modern structure dates from the establishment of the Cyprus Republic in 1960. Our choice of conducting 7 interviews on this public organization is based on the fact that the Police has recently been at the centre of controversy when the chief of Police, during a press conference stated that he was concerned with the involvement of immigrants in crime alleging that ‘One in three crimes involve foreigners’

1. What do you do?

Leaders:

He is the director of the department and his job is to accept applications for asylum seekers and verifying their personal details .

Employees:

- MA he is a police officer working at the barricade and his main duty is to check T/C who are coming in the South

MG his is a police officer at the barricade as well and his duty is to check those who are coming and go to the North

MGw she is at the barricade

PS he is a student at the police academy

- C he is working at the barricade and he is also responsible of all “*policemen who are on duty*”

M- pol she is a police officer and deals with the asylum applications

2. How long have you worked here?

Leaders:

Personnel manager: 2 years

Employees:

- MA for a year

MG for 2 years

MGw for 8 months

PS he is still a student at the academy

- C for 9 years

M- pol for almost a year

3. How many are employed here?

Leaders:

Six people in his section.

Employees:

➤ MA said 20 people

MG said almost 20

MGw said 30

PS said many

➤ C said 26

M- pol said 6

4. Would you say your organization is relatively open or closed to the recruitment of immigrants?

Leaders:

There are no barriers for the recruitment of T/C and ethnic minorities. Migrants, aliens are also not allowed.

Employees: They all said that their workplace is closed except from PS who said that many immigrants are employed and M- pol who said “*For now is closed to their recruitment except for ethnic minorities i.e. Armenians, Maronites.*”

5. Where would you place your own organization in relation to most others in terms of openness to recruiting immigrants? Far above average, above average, average, below average, far below average.

Leaders: Average

Employees:

They all said far above average except from PS who said average.

6. Do you think that the recruitment of people to your organization has gone properly (or appropriately)? Explain.

Leaders: His response was “yes of course”.

Employees:

There are two categories of responses the one leading to a conclusion of meritocratic recruitment and one implying that recruitment in the police force depends on ‘knowing people’. As far as the last category of responses is concerned MGW reported that the procedures are not going properly “because there are discriminations against women and in general. It’s obvious that they prefer to recruit men at the police body” and C agreed adding that “*there are people who shouldn’t work at the force but because they know “important people” they work here*”.

7. To what extent is appearance important in your recruitment? Explain.

Leaders: He argued that the only requirement is that concerning height.

Employees:

Three of the employees said that appearance is not important. The remaining argued that there are certain requirements connected to appearance such as age, weight, height, as well as tidy and clean look.

8. How important is it in your organization that new recruit fit into the work group? Do you consider that those with an immigrant background have more difficult fitting in than others?

Leaders:

The leader argued that the adjustment of a new comer depends upon character though he added that many minorities refuse to adjust to the Cypriot society's norms since they have a different culture value system. Furthermore he added, "*Ethnic minorities they don't want fit. As for T/C let them out. Maronites and Armenians have already assimilated.*"

Employees:

There has been a variation of responses which all lead to the conclusion that T/C and immigrants face an extra problem in fitting in. Another important element arising from the answers is that these vulnerable groups are blamed for their inability to fit in and that the only recognized ethnic minorities mentioned are those of the Maronites and Armenians indicating that no other minority is working in the police. MA said, "It depends on each person. If one shows interest he will easily fit in". He added that ethnic minorities, "*If they know language they will not face any difficulties*". MGW answered:

It's very important because the sooner the person fit in the better the job is done. Migrants and T/C are not working at the police. Maronites and Armenians don't face difficult to fit in because they already adjusted themselves in our society". PS said "It is important but at the police force is so easy to fit in. *Migrants are not allowed to work. Ethnic minorities don't find it difficult to fit in. T/C are allowed to work but since 1974 they choose not to come here and work*". C said "*Very important to fit from the beginning of the recruitment because then the job is done better. Ethnic minorities (Armenians and Maronites) don't face difficulties at the recruitment.*"

9. Do the wishes of other employees influence who is recruited? If so, does this work to the disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

Leaders:

No

Employees:

They all said no

10. Would your customers or clients react to the types of people you recruit? For instance, those with immigrant background? Do such considerations work to the disadvantage or advantage of those with immigrant background?

Leaders:

No

Employees:

Four of them said *no* while M- pol said that “yes it happens some times” but she doesn’t know if it affects ethnic minorities and C who said yes but he added that this does not influence minority groups.

11. Approximately, how many persons with immigrant background work here?

Leaders:

The leader argued that generally in police according to their population (Armenians and Maronites) the proportion working there is more than enough.

Employees:

There have been various answers to the specific question:

- MA doesn’t know the exact number
- MG said that there are some Maronites and Armenians but he doesn’t know the exact number and added that there are no migrants or T/C working for the police explaining that “*The reason the police doesn’t recruit migrants or T/C is because the priority is given to us and secondly for security reasons*”

MGw said that she doesn’t know the exact number but she is sure that there are more than a 100 Maronites and Armenians together.

PS said there are very few employed .

- C said that at his station there are three.
- M- pol said that she doesn’t know.

12. What form of employment do they tend to have? Fulltime, part-time, temporary, permanent)?

Leaders:

Fulltime

Employees:

They all said permanent except from C who said that they have both permanent and temporary employment.

13. [Workplace with shift-work]. What proportions of those working each shift are of immigrant background.

He does not know.

14. When people have to be laid off, are those with part-time, or temporary positions laid off first. How does this affect immigrants that are employed in your organization? Are their other bases for laying off workers.

Leaders:

He responded by saying “ *this is not Cyprus reality*”.

Employees:

They all agreed that the basis of dismissing a police officer is when he commits a crime or a discipline offence and that the dismissal criteria do not affect negatively minority groups, immigrants, or T/C.

15. Do you know of cases in your organization or branch where qualified immigrants are often employed in unqualified or low-status jobs? Why is this?

Leaders:

He argued that he knows only about G/C being qualified and they are employed in unqualified occupations.

Employees:

The employees referred to discriminatory practices taking place generally in Cyprus but not in the police while MGW stressed the fact that another, apart from minorities-immigrants-T/C, group that should be accounted as vulnerable is that of the female population.

16. Are there factors which limit or block career opportunities for employees with immigrant background in your organization or branch?

Leaders:

The leader’s exact words were, “*What I can say is that Armenian and Maronites have priority*”, indicating a feeling of reverse discrimination against G/C.

Employees:

All employees argue that there are no such factors and MA added, “ *On the contrary Armenians and Maronites are in favourable position than us because they are minorities.*”

17. What programs does your organization have for the further education or training of your personnel?

Leaders:

The leader answered that there are several programs but he did not specify on what subjects.

a) Do the differences in forms of employment (part-time, temporary, permanent) play a role with respect to education or training programs? Explain

Leaders:

He said that they are all full-timers.

Employees:

They all said that there are no differences except from M-Pol who said *yes* because, “Permanent police officers are going through a complete training while temporary staff going through the basic training”.

b) Are their differences in readiness to pursue education between employees with immigrant background and others?

Leaders:

He said that between Maronites/ Armenians and G/C there are no problems.

Employees:

They all said that there are no differences.

c) Are there differences between natives and those with immigrant backgrounds in the opportunities available for further training or education?

Leaders:

According to the law there are no differences.

Employees:

They all said that there are no differences.

18. What are the procedures for promotion and internal recruitment to positions in your organization? Do these operate to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background? Explain.

Leaders:

The procedure includes exams and an interview.

Employees:

The procedure includes the selection of units, experience, the opening of such positions and the declaration as well as passing of the exams and finally being called to an interview. Although most of the employees reported that there are no discriminatory practices taking place in the promotion process MA said that, "I see that some time these operate to the advantage of Maronites and Armenians while MGw stated "I don't think so (about minorities) . Women face discrimination because they are fewer than men."

19. What are the wage patterns between those with immigrant background and those without in your organization?

Leaders:

The leader said that there are no differences in wage patterns.

Employees:

They all said that there is no difference .

20. Approximately, how many employees with immigrant backgrounds are employed with you:

a) In top management

Leaders:

He doesn't know.

Employees:

All of the employees reported that they don't know except from C and MA that argued that there are a lot of Armenians and Maronites in high positions.

b) As section supervisors

Leaders: He doesn't know.

Employees:

N/A

c) In the personnel office.

Leaders:

He doesn't know though he assumes that there are many.

Employees:

N/A

21. Do you think that there are stereotypes and prejudices about those with immigrant background in your organization?

Leaders:

He answered no.

Employees:

They argued that at a professional level and among colleagues such stereotypes are not expressed though as MGw said "*Within our organisation no. But the way police is facing migrants , T/C there are many stereotypes as "Pontians are criminals,"*" indicating to a subtle prejudiced mentality existing within the police organisation.

22. In what ways do key persons in the organization make use of such stereotypes about those with immigrant background. To what extent does this go on?

Leaders:

The key persons don't use such stereotypes.

Employees:

Only MG reported an incident of prejudice by a key person taking place against a Pakistani person.

23. How does management react to expressions of stereotypes, prejudices, and racist addiction toward those with immigrant background? In the case that it is directed in general? In the case that it is directed toward another employee.

Leaders:

He said that such expressions do not take place in the police.

Employees:

Most of the employees said that such prejudiced action does not take place or that they are unaware of such incidents. However MG argued that such in the case of a prejudiced or discriminatory behaviour the management gives the officer a notice

while MGW said that in the case of abuse (minorities and immigrants) the officer may lose his job.

24. Do you consider that your organization employs too many with immigrant background – or too few?

Leaders: According to the minorities' population too many are employed.

Employees: They all answered that the number is enough.

Extra questions for leaders:

5. How are personnel recruited? More precisely.

Personnel is recruited through position announcement, exams, and interviews. Aliens are not recruited since they don't have the right while for ethnic minorities no discrimination is taking place as far as recruitment is concerned.

8. Are there different procedures for recruiting qualified and unqualified persons? How do any such differences affect the recruitment of people with immigrant background?

As the leader said there are different procedures for recruiting a qualified person. These procedures do not affect ethnic minorities (meaning Maronites, Armenians, Latins) and he mentioned that this question is not applicable when talking about T/C.

10. To what extent is language competence important in recruitment? Please explain. Has it happened that people with immigrant background seeking work with your organization were not recruited because they were considered not sufficiently competent in [English]?

He argued that he cannot answer this question since it is not applicable in the case of immigrants.

11. What other skills and knowledge are important in your recruitment? Do immigrants fare better or worse in comparison to native candidates? Please explain.

The leader said that Exams in English or any other linguistic knowledge is important as well as academic knowledge adding that, "*It doesn't matter if they are from different ethnic background.*"

12. How are the merits of job applicants judged? On the basis of:

a) Education

He said that it depends on what diplomas one will present.

b) Work experience from (England). In the case of those with immigrant backgrounds, is their work experience from their homeland taken into account?

He said that every additional qualification is important yet the most definite factor is for someone to be a Cypriot citizen or an EU national.

c) Other factors

13. Has your office sufficient competence to judge foreign education (and related merits) and work experience?

He commented that this is too easy.

14. We find that employers do not have much time or resources to investigate an application thoroughly. They have to operate with a sort shorthand. For instance, appearance. Or, the national or ethnic background of the person? Can it happen then that you employ someone from the majority society instead of someone with immigrant background? Are these stereotypes useful? Explain.

He considers the procedure described in the question as being problematic and he added that evaluation is based on qualification.

18. How important is personal knowledge of a job applicant? Does this affect employment of immigrants?

Personal knowledge is important in Cyprus though it does not affect the minorities negatively. Instead, as the leader stated the minorities have priority in accessing employment except for foreigners who are not allowed to apply for a police position.

19. Do recommendations and references for a job applicant from other parts of your organization or from other organizations in the branch weigh more than recommendations from another branch.

The answer was no.

28. How do you announce job openings? Would this operate to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

Job openings are made through announcements in the official newspaper of the Republic. The leader referred to the opportunities minorities have by saying, “ *As I told you no. Maronites and Armenians are equal to G/C.*”

29. How do you think information about job openings is spread? Does such spreading work to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

Announcement.

Particularities for Cyprus: Turkish-Cypriot Workers in the South

Turkish-Cypriots appear not to be aware of their rights, both as citizens of the Cyprus Republic as well as workers. There are difficulties in the communication with trade unions, such as language problems. Many times the skills and qualifications of Turkish-Cypriots is not properly recognised which result in failure to get better jobs and salary. One of the main reasons for Turkish-Cypriot employment in the south is the relatively high unemployment in North, the relatively better salaries than the north. The Turkish-Cypriot fear of losing their jobs makes them more vulnerable in accepting the working terms and conditions offered to them.

WORKPLACE REPORTS

Report of the private workplace interviews in Nicosia

Background

We conducted our interviews in the private workplace by choosing *Intercollege*, one of the largest and most academically acclaimed educational establishments, after the University of Cyprus, which has over 500 employees in Nicosia, Limassol and Larnaca. Nicosia is the headquarters of a modern campus situated in the suburb of Macedonitissa, close to the (now defunct and turned into UN headquarters) international airport of Nicosia.

1. What do you do?

We have conducted seven interviews at a private workplace in Nicosia. The persons we interviewed have following positions:

Leaders:

Member of the Board of Governors and Director of the Engineering Department

Employees:

C-he is a student enrolment advisor

S-she is the assistant in computers labs

M- she is the personal assistant of campus director

KM- is a lecturer

IG- is a student advisor

FI is a lecturer formerly involved in lecturer's trade union

2. How long have you worked here?

Leaders:

Director of the Engineering Department: 8 Years

Employees:

C is working for ten years

S is working for 3 ½ years

M is working for almost 3 years.

KM is working for 7 years

IG for two months

FI who has been with the college for 6 years

3. How many are employed here?

Leaders:

500

Employees:

S and M answered that there are approximately 500 employees, C did not know, while KM and IG said that there are many employees but they don't know the exact

number.

4. Would you say your organization is relatively open or closed to the recruitment of immigrants?

Leaders:

The leader has described his organisation as having an open attitude towards the recruitment of immigrants as well as Turkish-Cypriots.

Employees:

All of the employees think of the organisation as being open to the recruitment of immigrants. IG also added "*Cypriots are more than migrants and ethnic minorities. Migrants are recruited only at the faculty*". FI suggested that the college is relatively open to good lecturers and high calibre academics from abroad and would also be interested in Turkish-Cypriot scholars; the problem however arises in the way academics and managers are allocated, the position and power within the organisation, where persons of ethnic background other than Greek-Cypriot do not have the same opportunities, in spite the policies of the college.

5. Where would you place your own organization in relation to most others in terms of openness to recruiting immigrants? Far above average, above average, average, below average, far below average.

Leaders:

The leader thinks of his organisation as being above average in openness to recruiting immigrants compared to most others.

Employees:

All but one considered that the college is above average. KM said far above average. FI recognised that that the college may be above average on the subject, but this is because (a) the Cyprus average is so low and (b) the subtler dimensions of discrimination occur not so much at the level of formal entry (although even there it seems that there is a two-tier and speed policy, the official and unofficial) but at the level of power-relations, promotion and position within the college; nevertheless, this everyday reality suggest that the situation in the college there is much more advanced awareness of the issue, there are some policies in place and discrimination is more subtle.

6. Do you think that the recruitment of people to your organization has gone properly (or appropriately)? Explain.

Leaders:

The leader argued that the recruitment procedure is carried out in an appropriate manner especially for lectures. At the beginning, as the leader said, they announce the available positions, and then the CV's are examined and decide who will be called for an interview. Finally, there is a panel who decides with the director of each department whom to recruit.

Employees:

All of the employees have a positive attitude toward the recruitment procedure yet some expressed absence in knowing the details of this procedure. M despite her positive opinion toward recruitment procedures she identified that

“People are being called for interviews and the criteria are the same for migrants, ethnic minorities, T/C and G/C. However, there is a negative factor that working against migrants is work permit. We couldn't recruit migrants because ministry of interior denied to give work permits to a lot of lectures that were migrants and the labour office didn't give us permission to recruit migrants”.

The issue of Turkish-Cypriot employment in real terms is a very new phenomenon and the college collaborates with Turkish-Cypriot academics at many levels.

7. To what extent is appearance important in your recruitment? Explain.

Leaders:

The leader said that appearance is not important and he added

“Most important for us is their teaching abilities, their approach towards students, if they are good on the particular subject, their research etc”.

Employees:

There has been a variation of responses with all employees agreeing that appearance is important for a number of reasons such as the profession requires an appropriate level of professional look and in certain positions reserved especially for women, such as receptionists and the campus director's assistants, they commented the persons recruited are all beautiful.

8. How important is it in your organization that new recruit fit into the work group? Do you consider that those with an immigrant background have more difficult fitting in than others?

Leaders:

The leader answered that the ideal situation is the one where the new recruit adjust himself immediately yet he added that for immigrants this process is more difficult due to lack of knowledge of the Cypriot culture.

Employees:

All of the employees agreed that it is very important for a new recruit to fit into the work group. S and M and G said that it would be more difficult for a migrant, a member of an ethnic minority, or a T/C to fit in since there are cultural and language adjustment barriers. C and KM on the other hand claimed that such difficulties don't exist.

9. Do the wishes of other employees influence who is recruited? If so, does this work to the disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

Leaders:

The leader answered categorically no.

Employees:

Apart from S all other employees agreed that the wishes of current employees do not intervene to the disadvantage of recruiting a person that is not G/C. Yet S said, "What helps is if the candidate knows the employer. For e.g. When a member of ethnic minority, T/C or migrants apply for the same position that a G/C will, the possibilities for one to know personally the employer are more for the G/C and that work to the disadvantage of the above groups".

10. Would your customers or clients react to the types of people you recruit? For instance, those with immigrant background? Do such considerations work to the disadvantage or advantage of those with immigrant background?

Leaders:

The leader answered no.

Employees:

They all said no adding that such considerations could not work to the disadvantage of migrants, ethnic minorities and T/C except from IG who doesn't know.

11. Approximately, how many persons with immigrant background work here?

Leaders:

He said that in his department there no immigrants yet there are 15 in the college.

Employees:

There have been several reports on the number of immigrants employed. C and S don't know. M said that around 10- 15 migrants are working for the organization. M and C said that no T/C are working for the organization. IG said that she only saw three by the time she works there and KM said that migrants and ethnic minorities working there are more than Cypriots.

12. What form of employment do they tend to have? Fulltime, part-time, temporary, permanent)?

Leaders:

The leader said that employment is of permanent form.

Employees:

There have been mixed responses reported. C doesn't know. S said "Many are full-timers and part-timers as well" and M "that they work on a temporary basis as they have a contract for a year that can be renewed." KM said that they are employed both on a temporary and permanent basis and IG that they work on a contract basis.

13. When people have to be laid off, are those with part-time, or temporary positions laid off first. How does this affect immigrants that are employed in your organization? Are there other bases for laying off workers?

Leaders:

The leader said that in his experience only two people got fired who were fulltime and that all migrants working there are on 2-3 years contract without their status being a reason for a possible dismissal.

Employees:

C and IG reported that the three party arrangement operates against *vulnerable groups* when dismissals are concerned. The rest of the employees argued that the grounds for dismissal are based on objective criteria of how well an employee performs his duties and tasks.

14. Do you know of cases in your organization or branch where qualified immigrants are often employed in unqualified or low-status jobs? Why is this?

Leaders:

The leader said that none of the qualified immigrants is employed in un-qualified jobs.

Employees:

Only S knows such cases arguing that the reason for this phenomenon “is competition. These days most people have their degrees, masters etc and there is a lot of competition”.

15. Are there factors that limit or block career opportunities for employees with immigrant background in your organization or branch?

Leaders:

The leader said no.

Employees:

KM, M and C said that there are not any factors which limit or block career opportunities. S states that such factors exist and could be due to “*Language and visa permits*”.

In addition IG gave an example

“Yes there is an example of a Chinese student who is working at the cafeteria. The same time at the reception of the Humanities building there are Cypriot girls sitting there who are students. I never saw migrants who work at the reception”

16. What programs does your organization have for the further education or training of your personnel?

Leaders:

The leader said that each person is in charge to find programmes by themselves or with cooperation with their supervisor. The programmes include seminars and conferences. Additionally if an employee is interested for a PhD the college will help with scholarships.

Employees:

The employees reported a series of services and training programs provided by the college such as computer learning, language programs, seminars, lower fees, and PhD scholarships.

- a) Do the differences in forms of employment (part-time, temporary, permanent) play a role with respect to education or training programs?
Explain**

Leaders:

The leader said no.

Employees:

C and S agreed that differences in forms of employment do not play any role with the training programs. On the other hand M stated "Most of the times we are trying to support people who are working on a full time basis."

- b) Are their differences in readiness to pursue education between employees with immigrant background and others?**

Leaders:

The leader said no.

Employees:

They all said no

- c) Are there differences between natives and those with immigrant backgrounds in the opportunities available for further training or education?**

Leaders:

The leader said no.

Employees:

They all said no

17. What are the procedures for promotion and internal recruitment to positions in your organization? Do these operate to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background? Explain.

Leaders:

The leader argued that promotion and recruitment depends on *Teaching, research excellence, publication and the years of service* and that the procedures don't operate to the disadvantage of immigrants.

Employees:

All of the employees reported that there are objective and democratic criteria for recruitment and promotion though promotion per se is very difficult. IG although she doesn't know the procedures of promotion she argued

“I know is very difficult for one to be promoted. I believe that they work on the disadvantage because even Cypriots need to know the manager or the director personally to be promoted so I guess for a migrant it could be very difficult.”

19. What are the wage patterns between those with immigrant background and those without in your organization?

Leaders:

The leader argued that there are no differences in wage patterns.

Employees:

They all said that there is no difference.

20. Approximately, how many employees with immigrant backgrounds are employed with you:

a) In top management?

Leaders:

According to the leader there are no immigrants working in the top management.

Employees:

They all said that there is none with immigrant background.

b) As section supervisors?

Leaders:

According to the leader there are many immigrants working as supervisors.

Employees:

They reported they know some working but they don't know the number nor their ethnic or immigrant background.

c) In the personnel office?

Leaders:

He does not know.

Employees:

They reported they know some working but they don't know the number nor their ethnic or immigrant background.

21. Do you think that there are stereotypes and prejudices about those with immigrant background in your organization?

Leaders:

The leader said that some are prejudiced as far as the T/C are concerned, though they have been disqualified using a screening procedure.

Employees:

The employees agreed that there are stereotypes though they are not expressed due to the college's policy or due to political correctness. Only IG reported an incident of prejudiced and discriminatory behaviour against migrants.

22. In what ways do key persons in the organization make use of such stereotypes about those with immigrant background? To what extent does this go on?

Leaders:

The leader stated that key people don't use any stereotypes and try to help immigrants to battle such episodes.

Employees:

They reported either that they don't know or that the key actors don't use stereotypes.

23. How does management react to expressions of stereotypes, prejudices, and racist abuse toward those with immigrant background? In the case that it is directed in general? In the case that it is directed toward another employee.

Leaders:

He reported that there is a set of regulations that assist the battling of racist or discriminatory behaviour.

Employees:

They all referred to the anti-racist policy pursued by the college and to the fact that they are not in a position to describe the management's reaction since record for such incidents does not exist.

24. Do you consider that your organization employs too many with immigrant background – or too few?

Leaders:

The leader said "*they are few but if you compare it with another organisation they are enough.*"

Employees:

There has been a variation of responses. Some argued that the number of immigrants employed is satisfactory, others said that more should be employed and some claimed that the number is too high.

Extra questions for leaders:

6. How are personnel recruited?

There is panel responsible for each department and recruitment is based on the applicant's teaching capabilities and research in the field .He reported that there is some prejudice against vulnerable groups especially T/C and added that an additional problem arises with visa permit especially for non Europeans.

8. Are there different procedures for recruiting qualified and unqualified persons? How do any such differences affect the recruitment of people with immigrant background?

The leader does not know.

10. To what extent is language competence important in recruitment? Please explain. Has it happened that people with immigrant background seeking work with your organization were not recruited because they were considered not sufficiently competent in [English]?

This question is not applicable in this case since as the leader argued, "*Language is not important because our college is English speaking so we don't mind if one is not speaking Greek.*"

11. What other skills and knowledge are important in your recruitment? Do immigrants fare better or worse in comparison to native candidates? Please explain.

Research, publications ideas for new proposals and teaching abilities are the important skills for recruitment. There are groups that fare worse in comparison to native candidates since there has not been a cooperation experience with T/C.

12. How are the merits of job applicants judged?

On the basis of:

a) Education

By the research they have done their diplomas and certificates and finally what university they studied at or cooperate with.

b) Work experience from [England]. In the case of those with immigrant backgrounds, is their work experience from their homeland taken into account?

There is a ranking system. If an applicant full-fills certain experience requirements he is places on the rank system starting as an assistant lecturer.

c) Other factors

References from well known experts on the field of study are also important.

13. Has your office sufficient competence to judge foreign education (and related merits) and work experience?

The level of the applicant's university that he attended (how good it is) is evaluated.

14. We find that employers do not have much time or resources to investigate an application thoroughly. They have to operate with at shorthand. For instance, appearance. Or, the national or ethnic background of the person? Can it happen then that you employ someone from the majority society instead of someone with immigrant background? Are these stereotypes useful? Explain.

The leader considers the procedure based on personal knowledge as being very problematic. Thus the college follows a procedure where the CV of the applicant is evaluated and thereafter he is called for an interview in order to exhibit his abilities in class.

18. How important is personal knowledge of a job applicant? Does this affect employment of immigrants?

Although the leader reported that personal knowledge is not important he then added that immigrants may be at a disadvantage since Cypriot applicants have a higher chance to know people in the management personally.

19. Do recommendations and references for a job applicant from other parts of your organization or from other organizations in the branch weigh more than recommendations from another branch?

The leader answered no.

28. How do you announce job openings? Would this operate to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

Job openings are announced via Newspapers, Cypriot or foreign and technology – Internet Networking . As the leader stated this procedure offers equal chances to Cypriots and migrants.

29. How do you think information about job openings is spread? Does such spreading work to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

The leader was of no doubt that no discrimination occurs and that openings are “equal to migrants and Cypriots”.

Report of the private workplace interviews in Limassol

Background

We conducted our interviews in the private work-place by choosing a hotel in order to cover the most important economic sector for Cyprus which is the tourist industry . *Hawaii* hotel is a large sized five star hotel is employing 190 employees, set in over 20,000 square meters of landscaped gardens with exotic trees and sub-tropical plants, which extend to the seashore and it features 255 well appointed bedrooms including 13 superior rooms 11 suites.

1. What do you do?

We have conducted seven interviews at a private workplace in Limassol .The persons we interviewed have following positions:

Leaders:

Personnel manager

Employees:

- ES-HWI , GB-HWI and OS-HWI are housekeepers

IE-HWI is working at the reception

- LA-HWI *he said that he is room service supervisor but the personnel manager said that he is a waiter*

NJS-HWI is bar waitress

2. How long have you worked here?

Leaders:

Personnel manager: 3 years

Employees:

ES-HWI is working for 7 years

GB-HWI is working for 7 years

OS-HWI she is working at the working at the hotel for almost 9 years

IE-HWI- for a year
LA-HWI for five months
NJS-HWI is working at the hotel for almost a year

3. How many are employed here?

Leaders:
190

Employees:

There have been various responses for the number of employees:

ES-HWI said that at the hotel there 250 employees and at their section 3 women and 5 men

GB-HWI who is working a the same section as ES said that at their section there are 20 people

OS-HWI she said that at the hotel there many employees

IE-HWI who work at the reception said that at her section there are 15 people

LA-HWI said that at his section there are 7 people

NJS-HWI said that at the hotel there are many but she doesn't know the exact number

4. Would you say your organization is relatively open or closed to the recruitment of immigrants?

Leaders:

The leader has described his organisation as having an open attitude towards the recruitment of immigrants.

Employees:

All of the employees think of the organisation as being open to the recruitment of immigrants.

5. Where would you place your own organization in relation to most others in terms of openness to recruiting immigrants? Far above average, above average, average, below average, far below average.

Leaders:

The personnel manager thinks of his organisation as being above average in openness to recruiting immigrants compared to most others.

Employees:

The majority of employees classify their organisation as being far above average in openness to the recruitment of immigrants and T/C though there have been responses that placed the organisation to the average category in terms of openness. ES-HWI, IE-HWI, LA-HWI and OS place their organisation in terms of openness to recruiting migrants, ethnic minorities and T/C far above average. GB-HWI and NJS-HWI place their origination in terms of openness to the recruiting of migrants, ethnic minorities and T/C as being average.

6. Do you think that the recruitment of people to your organization has gone properly (or appropriately)? Explain.

Leaders:

The personnel manager said *“It could have been better”*.

Employees:

All of the employees had a positive attitude toward the organisation’s recruitment practice based mostly to the friendly environment offered by the management and people. ES-HWI believes that the recruitment of people has gone properly because the people are nice and IE-HWI reported similar satisfaction but she didn’t know to explain why. LA-HWI answered that the recruitment has gone properly because the employees treated migrants as being equal. OS finds that the recruitments of people has gone properly because management has a very open heart and they look at them as family. GB-HWI said *“It’s gone properly. For e.g. I applied the called me 3 times for an interview they felt that I knew the job, they like the fact that I speak 3 languages including my native”*. Finally, NJS-HWI answered *“Properly. They are very strict and careful because they want their business to succeed. They call all participants for three interviews and then they decide”*.

7. To what extent is appearance important in your recruitment? Explain.

Leaders:

The leader has distinguished between positions that involve everyday contact with customers and require a level of good appearance and those that involve tasks that are set apart from customers and therefore do not have appearance requirements.

Employees:

There has been a variation of responses concerning the value of appearance and the factors making appearance important. ES-HWI believes that appearance is important because *“when you look nice people (customers) feel comfortable and they are good with you”*. IE-HWI agreed that appearance is important and that they must look good and happy. NJS-HWI argued that for her appearance is not important but for the organization is and she explained:

“Actually it depends on the position. When one is working at a position where they come in everyday contact with customers they choose good- looking people, they prefer good-looking women.”

OS just said that is not important and LA-HWI based her answer on the multi-cultural environment of the hotel to argue that, *“you can see here at this hotel that many people from different countries are working here. We are all different in appearance and they don’t care”*. Finally GB said that appearance is not important since the management is interested only to their competence at work.

8. How important is it in your organization that new recruit fit into the work group? Do you consider that those with an immigrant background have more difficult fitting in than others?

Leaders:

The personnel manager argued that is very important for every new recruit to fit into the work group despite of the ethnic minority or immigrant background though he

argued that for migrants is even more difficult since they must adjust to the new environment of the country and culture.

Employees:

All the employees think that it is important to fit into the work group for a number of reasons while some claimed that they did not have any difficulty in fitting as new comers in the work group. ES-HWI answered “Yes, because we are foreigners and we must understand how things work here and communicate. Some times it depends on each person’s character and language is important as well”. GB-HWI said that ‘at this hotel migrants don’t face any difficulty to fit in’ and OS agreed “that migrants don’t face discrimination therefore they don’t face difficulties in fitting in”. NJS-HWI said that some may face difficulty to fit until they adjust themselves to the country. IE-HWI said “Yes because of communication – language”, and LA-HWI answered “Actually everywhere in the world if you start a new job you will find it difficult for the first 2 weeks. Some times it depends on the personality of each person.”

9. Do the wishes of other employees influence who is recruited? If so, does this work to the disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

Leaders:

The personnel manager answered no.

Employees:

They all said that the wishes of other employees couldn’t influence who is recruited LA-HWI expanded his answer by saying that the reason that the wishes of other employees couldn’t influence who is recruited is because “*they are very professional at this hotel and in 5 stars hotels you don’t find people who can influence the recruitment procedures*”.

10. Would your customers or clients react to the types of people you recruit? For instance, those with immigrant background? Do such considerations work to the disadvantage or advantage of those with immigrant background?

Leaders:

The personnel manager reported that the clients’ preferences influence the recruitment up to a point. He added that Europeans prefer to be accommodated by Cypriot employees rather from , for example, someone Pakistan. He then argued that even Cypriots have their preferences on who, according to ethnic background, is going to serve them giving an example where many Cypriots wanted service by a woman from Philippines.

Employees:

They all said *no* except from IE-HWI who said *yes* and she explained “ *because tourists here coming for holidays and want to have a nice time and many times it depends on us. If we are not doing our job well (helping them having a good time) they will complain and I believe it will affect (us). But if one is a foreigner or not it doesn’t make any difference*”

11. Approximately, how many persons with immigrant background work here?

Leaders:

10 per cent

Employees:

ES-HWI said “I know that we are 3 from Philippines some Russians I don’t know the exact number” , IE-HWI said around 20 ,LA-HWI and OS-HWI did not know the exact number and finally NJS-HWI argued that there is a 50% of immigrant employees.

12. What form of employment do they tend to have? Fulltime, part-time, temporary, permanent)?

Leaders:

The personnel manager said that employment is of permanent form.

Employees:

There have been mixed responses reported though most referred to permanent employment.

ES-HWI and GB-HWI said fulltime, IE-HWI said part-timers, LA-HWI said that there are some full timers and some part timers ,OS-HWI said “6 months as try out and then with a year contract”, and NJS-HWI said that there are some in a temporary basis and some on a permanent .

13. When people have to be laid off, are those with part-time, or temporary positions laid off first. How does this affect immigrants that are employed in your organization? Are their other bases for laying off workers?

Leaders:

The personnel manager said that the procedure followed to lay off an employee depends on his/her inability to carry out the tasks and requirements of the position. Due to this inability the employee is given a notice and if the problem persists he/she is laid off. He added that the procedure is applicable for all employees and being a migrant is not a factor influencing the decision for laid off.

Employees:

All of the employees seem to agree that the basis of dismissal depends on whether they carry-out their duties efficiently. They are not aware of the procedures followed for laying-off an employee and only one employee reported that being a migrant may influence a decision for dismissal.

14. Do you know of cases in your organization or branch where qualified immigrants are often employed in unqualified or low-status jobs? Why is this?

Leaders:

The personnel manager said that none of the qualified immigrants is employed in un-qualified jobs.

Employees:

Two of the employees were unaware of such cases, while another two argued that they did not know of any such cases since each person applying for a position is doing so according to his/her qualifications. There has been two cases where ES-HWI said she knows a qualified woman working in an un-qualified job and she explained that the reason is doing so is *“because either she likes it (working here as a cleaner-house keeper) or because she couldn’t find ant other job”*, and IE-HWI said *“Yes I know a man you is working in a very unqualified job though he is well educated”*.

15. Are their factors that limit or block career opportunities for employees with immigrant background in your organization or branch?

Leaders:

The personnel manager said no.

Employees:

ES-HWI said that there are not any factors, and IE-HWI and GB-HWI could not think of any factors. LA-HWI argued that since Cyprus is a member of the EU foreigners have legal protection, and thus equal rights. OS-HWI believes that if someone is delivering good work then he/she is going to be promoted despite the fact that she is working as a house-keeper for the past seven years. Finally NJS-HWI answered *“They will not let me (promoted). I believe the reason is that if persons are promoted they have to pay more, so they don’t promote people very often”*.

16. What programs does your organization have for the further education or training of your personnel?

Leaders:

The leader said that they offer programs concerning Customers and technical matters.

Employees:

Most of the employees said that there are seminars and training programs offered. OS even mentioned language courses offered. Finally, NJS-HWI said *“For my section only the head of the bar is trained bar. They told us that we will pass through training but we never did”*.

**c) Do the differences in forms of employment (part-time, temporary, permanent) play a role with respect to education or training programs?
Explain**

Leaders:

The personnel manager said no.

Employees:

Three of the employees said that there are no differences concerning the education programs while another two were unaware of such differences. Only ES-HWI said, “*Yes. Permanent workers enjoy more seminars because as permanent workers they have more obligations than others*”.

d) Are their differences in readiness to pursue education between employees with immigrant background and others?

Leaders:

The personnel manager said no.

Employees:

Three of the employees said that there are no differences concerning the education programs while another two were unaware of such differences. Only ES-HWI said yes.

c) Are there differences between natives and those with immigrant backgrounds in the opportunities available for further training or education?

Leaders:

The personnel manager said no.

Employees:

Three of the employees said that there are no differences concerning the education programs while another two were unaware of such differences. Only ES-HWI said yes.

17. What are the procedures for promotion and internal recruitment to positions in your organization? Do these operate to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background? Explain.

Leaders:

The personnel manager argued that promotion and recruitment depends on value and experience and that the procedures don't operate to the disadvantage of immigrants.

Employees:

Only two of the employees did not know the procedures and factors leading to promotion. The rest stressed competence and efficiency to carry out the tasks required as being the crucial factors for promotion while they did not report any discriminatory procedures that operate against immigrant workers.

19. What are the wage patterns between those with immigrant background and those without in your organization?

Leaders:

The personnel manager argued that there are no differences in wage patterns.

Employees:

They all said that there is no difference except from NJS-HWI

Who said "Me for example I get paid lower than a Cypriot"

20. Approximately, how many employees with immigrant backgrounds are employed with you:

d) In top management?

Leaders:

According to the leader there are no immigrants working in the top management.

Employees:

They all said that there is no one with immigrant background except from LA-HWI who said about one Italian that he left .

e) As section supervisors?

Leaders:

According to the leader there are no immigrants working as section supervisors.

Employees:

LA is a section supervisor and OS who is Cypriot knows of an immigrant working at the restaurant as supervisor.

f) In the personnel office?

Leaders:

According to the leader there are no immigrants working in the personnel office.

Employees:

LA knows of a French person working in the personnel office.

21. Do you think that there are stereotypes and prejudices about those with immigrant background in your organization?

Leaders:

The personnel manager said that such stereotypes exist among colleagues.

Employees:

The majority of employees did not report any incidents concerning stereotypes or prejudice against immigrants. ES-HWI said that "*Yes I heard that Polish women are dirty but we are clean (she is form Philippines)*", and NJS-HWI reported, "there is man working at the pool- cleaning the pool. He is an excellent barman and he asked them to work at the bar and they told him "we don't like black people".

22. In what ways do key persons in the organization make use of such stereotypes about those with immigrant background? To what extent does this go on?

Leaders:

The personnel manager stated that key people don't use any stereotypes.

Employees:

Except NJS who reported the same incident in Question 21 no other employee reported any incident of stereotypes made by the organisation .

23. How does management react to expressions of stereotypes, prejudices, and racist abuse toward those with immigrant background? In the case that it is directed in general? In the case that it is directed toward another employee.

Leaders:

The personnel manager responded that they try to investigate such issues.

Employees:

They argued that they don't know about the management's reaction on such issues since they are unaware of incidents and expressions concerning stereotypes, prejudices, and racist abuse.

24. Do you consider that your organization employs too many with immigrant background – or too few?

Leaders:

The personnel manager said that very few immigrants are employed.

Employees:

OS, GB-HWI and NJS-HWI said many. ES-HWI said too few and IE-HWI said enough. Finally, LA-HWI stated

This organisation doesn't care if one is a foreigner is not. At other hotels when I complete the recruitment form there was a question about ethnicity or religion. They recruit many foreigners.

6. How are personnel recruited?

The personnel manager said that there is a procedure followed in the recruitment of personnel consisting of three interviews and by using same standards of judging competence though he argued that migrants, ethnic minorities and T/C have a disadvantage compared to G/C since they have a difficulty to adapt the standards of a five-star hotel.

8. Are there different procedures for recruiting qualified and unqualified persons? How do any such differences affect the recruitment of people with immigrant background?

The personnel manager referred to a different procedure concerning the employment of qualified personnel since these people are interview by the general director. Furthermore, he argued that differentials in the procedure create a kind of confusion,

or discontent, among the immigrant applicants since they expect to be employed by the first interview.

10. To what extent is language competence important in recruitment? Please explain. Has it happened that people with immigrant background seeking work with your organization were not recruited because they were considered not sufficiently competent in [English]?

The personnel manager stressed the importance of knowing English as an important factor to the recruitment of an employee since without this qualification the applicant is not employed.

11. What other skills and knowledge are important in your recruitment? Do immigrants fare better or worse in comparison to native candidates? Please explain.

Experience is considered to be an important recruitment factor while difficulties in Communication issues put immigrants at a disadvantage since many of them don't speak English.

12. How are the merits of job applicants judged?

On the basis of:

a) Education

The personnel manager claimed that it depends upon the requirements of the position.

b) Work experience from [England]. In the case of those with immigrant backgrounds, is their work experience from their homeland taken into account?

The personnel manager argued that experience in general is taken into account.

c) Other factors

13. Has your office sufficient competence to judge foreign education (and related merits) and work experience?

The personnel manager answered no.

14. We find that employers do not have much time or resources to investigate an application thoroughly. They have to operate with a sort shorthand. For instance, appearance. Or, the national or ethnic background of the person? Can

it happen then that you employ someone from the majority society instead of someone with immigrant background? Are these stereotypes useful? Explain.

The leader answered that in the case of G/C investigation is easier compared to researching about ethnic minorities' and T/C's applicants since for G/C there is the convenience and availability of information about the applicant's work experience and professional background.

18. How important is personal knowledge of a job applicant? Does this affect employment of immigrants?

He argued that it is important yet impossible to apply thus it does not affect immigrant workers.

19. Do recommendations and references for a job applicant from other parts of your organization or from other organizations in the branch weigh more than recommendations from another branch?

The personnel manager answered yes.

28. How do you announce job openings? Would this operate to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

Job openings are announced through Newspapers , trade unions, and the labour office.

The personnel manager argued that the ways of announcing job openings operate at a disadvantage for the immigrants since both the trade unions and the labour office want to promote Cypriots.

Report of the Public Workplace in Limassol

Background

The public workplace chosen is the Limassol municipality which is the largest municipality in terms of persons residing within its boundaries and employs 500 persons. No migrants can be employed in any public body unless they (i) become Cypriot (and recently European) citizens and (b) they are certified as proficient Greek speakers.

1. What do you do?

Leaders:

Personnel manager

Employees:

- *A-lim is the general inspector at municipality's health board*
- *K-Lim is an inspector at the health board*
- *M-lim is an accounting officer at Limassol municipality*
- *M-LIM is a higher secretarial officer*
- *KW-LIM is an executive engineer*
- *T-Lim is a technician at the traffic lights maintenance department*

2. How long have you worked here?

Leaders:

Personnel manager: 13 years

Employees:

- *A-lim 21 years*
- *K-Lim 4 years*
- *M-lim 14 years*
- *M-LIM 6 years*
- *KW-LIM 7 years*
- *T-Lim 3.5 years*

3. How many are employed here?

Leaders:

500 people

Employees:

With the exception of A-lim who answered for his department (20 people) the others

said 450-550 employees working to the municipality.

4. Would you say your organization is relatively open or closed to the recruitment of immigrants?

Leaders:

The personnel manager explained that the municipality is closed towards the recruitment of immigrants because according to the law one must be a Cypriot citizen to work there. T/C have the right to work there according to the law though no T/C is currently an employee. Furthermore there is a small legal window permitting the hiring of a foreigner, as a temporary worker, if no Cypriot workers are willing to undertake the position.

Employees:

The majority of employees described their workplace as being closed to the recruitment of foreign workers. Paradoxically one described his organisation as being open. The rest spoke about the legal restriction imposed on the issue of immigrant employment and one referred that there are some T/C employed on a temporary basis in occupations such as cleaners.

5. Where would you place your own organization in relation to most others in terms of openness to recruiting immigrants? Far above average, above average, average, below average, far below average.

Leaders:

The leader placed his organisation as being below average in openness.

Employees:

The responses given vary a lot. One said that is open, two that they don't know, another that he could not make such measurement and one that is far below average.

6. Do you think that the recruitment of people to your organization has gone properly (or appropriately)? Explain.

Leaders:

As long as the legal regulations are followed the recruitment is described as being appropriate.

Employees:

All of the employees with the exception of T-lim agreed that the recruitment procedure has gone properly. T-lim's opinion is that the procedure is not the appropriate since there are cases that no exams have been given in order to allocate a specific position.

7. To what extent is appearance important in your recruitment? Explain.

Leaders:

Generally appearance does not play a significant role. The applicants' exam results are the basic criterion for recruitment. However in the case of employment in

positions such as those in kinder-garden appearance and age are important since no old people are employed.

Employees:

They all said that appearance is not important at all as far as Limassol municipality is concerned.

8. How important is it in your organization that new recruit fit into the work group? Do you consider that those with an immigrant background have more difficult fitting in than others?

Leaders:

The leader considered it to be an important matter that is overcome through the help of other colleagues.

Employees:

All of the employees considered it important for the new recruit to fit as soon as possible to the rest of the work group. Three employees have reported that immigrants, ethnic minorities, and T/C will face more barriers to adjust as newcomers due to cultural and language problems as well as from ethnocentric behaviour expressed by other colleagues.

9. Do the wishes of other employees influence who is recruited? If so, does this work to the disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

Leaders:

No

Employees:

There has been two employees arguing that employees opinion can operate against the recruitment of immigrants, ethnic minorities, or T/C. T-LIM stated *“Yes and it does work to the disadvantage of migrants and ethnic minorities because Cyprus is a very small island and people know each other. It’s obvious and we all know it that G/C will help each other”*.

10. Would your customers or clients react to the types of people you recruit? For instance, those with immigrant background? Do such considerations work to the disadvantage or advantage of those with immigrant background?

Leaders:

No

Employees:

The six of them said no.

11. Approximately, how many persons with immigrant background work here?

Leaders:

Only one person as the leader said. They also hire T/C for a few months.

Employees:

They are unaware of any immigrant to have worked ever in the municipality. One of the employee referred to a T/C working as a seasonal worker while others have given reports about occasional employment of 4 T/C during the past years working as seasonal workers.

12. What form of employment do they tend to have? Fulltime, part-time, temporary, permanent)?

Leaders:

Temporary

Employees:

All of them referred to temporary and seasonal work except one , KW mentioned the case of an employee with an immigrant background working on a permanent basis due to the fact that he is married with a Cypriot citizen.

13. [Workplace with shift-work]. What proportions of those working each shift are of immigrant background.

No report

14. When people have to be laid off, are those with part-time, or temporary positions laid off first. How does this affect immigrants that are employed in your organization? Are their other bases for laying off workers.

Leaders:

The leader argued that since these people are employed as seasonal workers they also know that their employment status is temporary as well.

Employees:

Most of the employees argued that they could not give an answer since the employment policy followed by the municipality and is based on the legal provisions does not permit the entry of immigrant workers. However, K-lim reported an unofficial norm operating at the municipality having to do with the prejudice of certain employees against T/C: *“I have to clear something. By the time the municipal is not recruiting migrants I cannot say how it will affect migrants. In general, there are organizations who are racists and xenophobic. Regarding municipality I can give you an example. The time where we decide to recruit T/C there were 2 co-workers of mine, more specifically one of them, the person was opposed to the recruitment of the T/C. That person said “I don’t want to have any relation with Turks”.*

15. Do you know of cases in your organization or branch where qualified immigrants are often employed in unqualified or low-status jobs? Why is this?

Leaders:

He is unaware of such cases.

Employees:

Some knew of such cases but they did not concern municipal employees .

16. Are there factors which limit or block career opportunities for employees with immigrant background in your organization or branch?

Leaders:

The leader said, *“The answer is no because we don’t hire them.”*

Employees:

They all said no stressing the fact that there is absence of entry to employment , specifically on a permanent basis, for minorities, immigrants, and T/C.

17. What programs does your organization have for the further education or training of your personnel?

Leaders:

He argued that there is nothing specific apart from some education programs for which he did not specify the subject.

a) Do the differences in forms of employment (part-time, temporary, permanent) play a role with respect to education or training programs? Explain

Leaders:

The leader’s comment indicated that they are not willing to offer education courses for employees working on a temporary basis.

Employees:

They all argued that there are no differences since all employees work on a permanent basis.

b) Are their differences in readiness to pursue education between employees with immigrant background and others?

Leaders:

The leader argued that if they ever hire a migrant worker discrimination on the specific matter will not take place.

Employees:

They all said that such differences cannot be described since there are no immigrant employees and since the T/C employed are on a temporary basis and thus they don’t attend to educational courses.

c) Are there differences between natives and those with immigrant backgrounds in the opportunities available for further training or education?

Leaders:

The leader said once again that they don’t hire immigrant workers.

Employees:

They all said no since there is no immigrant employed .

18. What are the procedures for promotion and internal recruitment to positions in your organization? Do these operate to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background? Explain.

Leaders:

The procedure takes into consideration experience and qualification though no account on the specific matter can be given for immigrants and T/C since they are not employed.

Employees:

They all referred to experience, years of service, qualifications and value. Additionally K- lim stated *“As far as it concerns T/C they never got the chance for promotion because they work on a seasonal basis”*.

19. What are the wage patterns between those with immigrant background and those without in your organization?

Leaders:

The leader answered no.

Employees:

Although the wage patterns are fixed according to the wage scales provided by the government one employee argued that immigrants and T/C are at a disadvantage since if employed they will be on a temporary seasonal basis and thus get a lower wage compared to the G/C permanent staff.

20. Approximately, how many employees with immigrant backgrounds are employed with you:

a) In top management

Leaders:

None

Employees:

None

b) As section supervisors

Leaders: None

Employees:

None

c) In the personnel office.

Leaders:

None

Employees:

None

21. Do you think that there are stereotypes and prejudices about those with immigrant background in your organization?

Leaders:

No because the particular groups are not working there.

Employees:

They argued that no prejudice and stereotypes exist in the workplace against minorities, immigrants, and T/C since no employee belonging to these groups is currently employed in the municipality. However, they expressed their worry that due to the general prejudice that exists in the Cyprus society if ever a member of these groups will be employed he will most likely be a victim of prejudice and discriminatory behaviour from colleagues.

22. In what ways do key persons in the organization make use of such stereotypes about those with immigrant background. To what extent does this go on?

Leaders:

The key persons don't use such stereotypes.

Employees: T-LIM said that key people use stereotypes against migrants, ethnic minorities and T/C and K-Lim argued that such stereotypes occur not on a professional but on an interpersonal level. The rest of the employees said that there are no such incidents since the key persons have no experience working with immigrants, minorities, or T/C.

23. How does management react to expressions of stereotypes, prejudices, and racist addiction toward those with immigrant background? In the case that it is directed in general? In the case that it is directed toward another employee.

Leaders: They management does not react since there is no such employee.

Employees:

They management does not react since there is no such employee. On a community level K-lim said that the mayor is concerned with the problems of Romas and T/C and wants to promote their solution.

24. Do you consider that your organization employs too many with immigrant background – or too few?

Leaders: Too few.

Employees:

They all said too few. K- lim added "In general I believe that if a migrant, or ethnic minority member, or a T/C deserves a place in any position that a G/C applied as well but the G/C doesn't deserve it then one of the above group deserves it, and I believe that the person who deserves the position should get it" and he pointed out "Generally speaking regarding the municipality I believe that there is a xenophobic and racist climate as in the whole society".

Extra questions for leaders:

5. How are personnel recruited? More precisely.

There are 2 categories of employment. One is when the positions are announced officially and the participants are called for exams and those who do well are called for interviews by the management. For higher positions no exams are taking place. The participants are called for an interview. For temporary workers, the three- party committee calls the workers only for interviews because of the nature of the job. Migrants are not allowed to work for the municipal. They don't have the right unless they gain the Cypriot citizenship.

8. Are there different procedures for recruiting qualified and unqualified persons? How do any such differences affect the recruitment of people with immigrant background?

When it comes to permanent positions then the procedure followed is position announcement, exams and then an interview. When it comes to temporary positions then the participants are called for an interview. The procedures work to the disadvantage of immigrant, ethnic minorities and T/C groups recruitment because they don't speak Greek.

10. To what extent is language competence important in recruitment? Please explain. Has it happened that people with immigrant background seeking work with your organization were not recruited because they were considered not sufficiently competent in [English]?

The leader said , *"it is very important. According to the law the people working for the municipal the candidate should speak Greek and have the Cyprus citizenship. Therefore immigrants cannot work for the municipal because they are not Cypriot citizens and secondly if a person finished high school at his/ her country, it means that they don't speak the Greek language and therefore it would be very difficult for them find a job in the government."*

11. What other skills and knowledge are important in your recruitment? Do immigrants fare better or worse in comparison to native candidates? Please explain.

The leader argued that as long as an immigrant does not hold the Cyprus citizenship he cannot claim an employment position. If he manages to obtain the citizenship status then he will be able to follow the procedure of exams leading to possible employment.

12. How are the merits of job applicants judged? On the basis of:

a) Education

It depends on the position. The municipal might ask for a university diploma, masters or high school diploma.

b) Work experience from (England). In the case of those with immigrant backgrounds, is their work experience from their homeland taken into account?

The Leader commented, *“They will only ask for work experience if it’s for managerial positions. It never happened before but I believe that if the person has the citizenship and speaks good Greek language then I guess their experience will be taken into account.”*

c) Other factors

Qualifications and experience.

13. Has your office sufficient competence to judge foreign education (and related merits) and work experience?

Yes since they contact the university that the applicant attended and his embassy.

14. We find that employers do not have much time or resources to investigate an application thoroughly. They have to operate with a sort shorthand. For instance, appearance. Or, the national or ethnic background of the person? Can it happen then that you employ someone from the majority society instead of someone with immigrant background? Are these stereotypes useful? Explain.

They choose the most appropriate person by screening the applicants’ qualifications.

18. How important is personal knowledge of a job applicant? Does this affect employment of immigrants?

He considers personal knowledge for high positions as being important. As far as immigrants are concerned he could not refer to the affects since they don’t employ any.

19. Do recommendations and references for a job applicant from other parts of your organization or from other organizations in the branch weigh more than recommendations from another branch.

The answer was yes.

28. How do you announce job openings? Would this operate to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

Announcements in newspapers and the official newspaper of the Republic.

29. How do you think information about job openings is spread? Does such spreading work to the advantage or disadvantage of those with immigrant background?

It works to the disadvantage of immigrants since these announcements are done in Greek.

Report of the labour market interviews for Cyprus

Background

We have conducted five labour market mediator interviews. The interviews were conducted in two private and two public labour market mediator offices. As far as the public labour market interviews are concerned we have chosen two Cyprus Labour Offices one located in Nicosia and one in Limassol. Apart from mediators in the public sector we have included an interview conducted on a policy maker working for the Labour Office in Nicosia as to enrich our knowledge with the specifics concerning regulations and policies for immigrants in the labour market. Since his position differs from those of the two public mediators his responses will be recorded separately. In the public labour market office two mediators were interviewed both located in Nicosia. We have not tried to build on assumptions that may arise because of differences between private mediators and due to the different city location. Since Cyprus is a very small country the short distances between cities make possible for the private mediators to have extensive activity across all the cities of the country despite of their office base. Thus as far as labour market is concerned our main focus is to identify differences that exist between the public and private labour mediators since location in this case is a redundant dimension.

1. What do you do?

Private:

(M1)Mediator 1: Travel Agent

(M2)Mediator 2: Mediator in finding employment for foreign workers

Public:

(M3)Mediator 3: Nicosia Labour Office- Asylum Seekers department

(M4)Mediator 4: Limassol Labour Office

(P) Policy maker: Nicosia Labour Office

2. How long have you worked here?

Private:

M1: 14 years

M2: one year

Public:

M3: one year

M4: 4 years

P: 10 years

3. Would you say your organization is relatively open or closed to the placement of immigrants?

Private:

They both described their organisation as being very open to the placement of immigrants.

Public:

They both described their organisation as being open to the placement of immigrants. P :The Labour Office is open to the employment of immigrants, asylum seekers, T/C , and political refugees. Immigrants come in Cyprus for a specific employment which they cannot change, asylum seekers work in occupations where there is demand yet shortage of labour supply by Cypriot workers, and political refugees as well as T/C have the same rights to employment as G/C.

4. Where would you place your own organization in relation to most others in terms of openness to the placement of immigrants? Far above average, above average, average, below average, far below average.

Private:

Both mediators have placed their organisation as being far above average in openness to the placement of immigrants.

Public:

Both mediators have placed their organisation as being above average in openness to the placement of immigrants.

P: Above Average.

5. How are job-seekers screened? What guidelines do potential employers provide you?

Private:

M1 referred to the importance of race and nationality as being factors influencing the screening of an employee and then he added that the demand for employment is high while the positions are few. M2 said that especially in the case of house-keepers , these women must have a proof of being healthy, i.e. have medical exams. Both mediators said that the employers provide specifications for the employee they seek in a specific position.

Public:

M3 said that job-seekers are judged by their qualifications and by the guidelines of employee profile provided by the employers. M4 argued that employers ask for Cypriot employees and when the position is not filled by them they provide the employer with a foreign employee.

P: Generally screening is based on qualifications. There is a problem with asylum seekers that refuse to take a specific position due to lack of transport or because they do not like the specific position. In other cases applicants claim to have certain qualifications however they have no official papers to prove it. Priority to the employment of applicants is given when there is no Cypriot to undertake the position and the employers supply the description of the position including information on the tasks and the wage to be given.

6. Are there differences for qualified labor? Unqualified labor?

Private:

Both mediators said that according to the needs and specifications of the position they search for the appropriate personnel to fill the position.

Public:

M4 said that jobs are allocated according to the qualifications of the potential employee and the requirements of the specific position. M3 argued that most positions

concern unqualified labour though many qualified persons have applied for an unqualified labour market positions.

P: There is a single procedure for qualified and unqualified occupations.

7. Are there criteria or procedures that operate to the disadvantage of job-seekers with immigrant backgrounds. Explain.

Private:

M1 said that employers define the requirements though positions refer to a demand for unqualified labour. M2 said that knowing English is essential since if the employee candidate does not have this skill he/she will not be hired.

Public:

M3 talked about the skin phobia or preference expressed by employers who prefer to have white colour foreign workers rather than black skin employees. M4 referred to language as being a barrier to the hiring of a potential immigrant worker since many, from countries such as Bangladesh ,don't know any English.

P: There are no criteria that operate against immigrants. Immigrants come to work under a specific contract, asylum seekers are judged according to their qualifications and T/C and political refugees have equal access to employment as G/C.

8. To what extent is appearance important in placement? Explain.

Private:

M1 and M2 said that in the housekeeping appearance is very important especially to the lady who will employ the house- keeper. The employer needs to see a photograph of the candidate domestic worker to see if she is pleasant looking or not. If someone is working in their house they want someone who is pretty otherwise the candidate is rejected by the employer.

Public:

M3 said that the skin colour is important since employers seek for white skin employees. M4 claimed that foreigners coming from countries such as Pakistan smell badly therefore she finds it difficult to send them to an employer since herself uses room deodorant when such people visit her office.

P: Colour, ethnic origin , and nationality play no role in employment; factors such as being tidy and clean appear to be important.

9. To what extent is language competence important in placement? Explain.

Private:

They both argued that knowing basic English is a definite factor for a candidate to be employed.

Public:

They both argued that knowing basic English is a definite factor for a candidate to be employed.

P: Language is important since communication skills are essential to the completion of the tasks demanded by the position. In manual oriented occupation the knowledge of the Greek language is not essential.

10. What other skills and knowledge are important in placement? Do immigrants fare better or worse in comparison to native candidates? Much worse? Worse? Better? Much better? Explain.

Private:

M1 and M2 said that it all depends on the criteria the employer is asking. For example if he needs a technician the candidates should know what a technician is. Then M1 added ,“It depends on the money aspect as well. Natives know the language they can move around they have everything in their hands. They can do the job and then go home. Immigrants they have nowhere to go. They are coming in Cyprus for specific period of time and they know that they have to work all day.”

Public:

M3 said that since employers ask only unqualified employees other skill are not important. The candidate must only have good character. M4 said that it all depends on what the employer wants.

P: The more qualifications one has the better though it all depends upon the nature of the position.

11. We find that employers do not have much time or resources to investigate an application thoroughly. They have to operate with a sort of shorthand. For instance, appearance. Or, the national or ethnic background of the person? Are these stereotypes useful? Explain. Can they be problematic?

Private:

Both mediators said that the employer fills in a form describing the basic requirements based on country of origin, appearance and gender and this is the only possible procedure of finding an employee.

Public:

M4 said that employers do not choose on the basis of nationality but rather they take into account factors such as appearance, qualification and the person to be clean in order to be employed. M3 said that there have been problematic generalizations against certain nationalities that acquired bad reputation and thus the employers avoid to hire members from such countries.

P: He agrees that many employers follow such procedures yet this sometimes benefits foreign workers.

12. In recruitment, employers often take into account the possible reactions of other employees to a recruit, or the reactions of clients or customers. Do you come into contact with such employers?

Private: They both said no.

Public:

They both said no.

P: It happens in rare occasion for example in the restaurant sector. Nevertheless such cases are rare since colour and national identity are not important.

13. Among immigrants, do the conditions of employment tend to be more often part-time and short-term?

Private:

M2 said that certain full time females also have a part time job. M1 argued that according to law employees are coming for 4 years. Then he added “ I think this must change and give them more years permit to stay because they get used to the employer and vice versa. And it is not necessary to bring another foreigner and start the training from the beginning. I think they should stay for ten years.”

Public:

M3 said that employees come for full-time employment while M4 argued due to lack of full time employment she advises applicants to work in two part-time job positions though the candidates refuse to do that.

P: Immigrants if they are satisfied with their employer are mostly occupied on a full-time basis. Asylum seekers since they perceive their future uncertain in Cyprus they search for a second part-time job.

14. When there are layoffs, are immigrants “first to go” because of their short-term or only part-term employment? Other factors?

Private:

M1 argued that there is discrimination from the employer. A foreigner is an easy asset for everybody since if an employer goes bankrupt he could easily say to the employee *to pack his things and go*.

Public:

M3 said that the employers use two kinds of reason to lay off an employee. They either claim that they no longer have work or that the employee is not good for the position.

P: He argued that according to law if their services are no longer required due to excess of labour supply immigrants are the first to be laid off and be compensated. He argued that the immigrants are aware of their terms of employment since the contract describes also the regulation for laying off an immigrant. Nevertheless he commented that most of the complaints he receives are from G/C who claim that they were fired because immigrants, asylum seekers, and T/C work for less money in the specific occupations.

15. Do you know of cases where qualified immigrants are engaged in unqualified or low-status jobs and positions? Ask the IP to identify professional and job career constraints operating to block or limit opportunities for qualified immigrants.

Private:

They are both aware of such cases and M2 added that immigrants coming for work they are employed in unqualified positions in which Cypriots refuse to work.

Public:

They are both aware of such cases and M4 referred again to the language barrier.

P: he argued that the basic problem arises when the applicants claim to have high qualifications and yet no official papers to prove it.

16. Employers typically have key decision makers (gatekeepers) decide on jobs, positions, careers, special educational programs, etc. In your experience, who are these “gatekeepers”, that is decision-makers. That is what are their positions in their places of work.

Private: M1 said that it depends on the requirement. Usually it is the boss or the public relation man or a personnel manager.

Public:

M4 said that the gatekeepers are the employers themselves.

P: Gatekeepers operate in big organizations where there is an organized method of management and recruiting. In such companies and industries (e.g. hotels) there are two kinds of gatekeepers: those that climbed the hierarchy through experience and they screen according to that experience and a second category consisted of highly educated professionals who follow the scientific methods that they’ve been taught. As far as the small family businesses, in those the owner decides according to the applicant’s experience. Finally, P argued that ethnicity and colour are not bases that block career opportunities.

17. In your judgment are they relatively fair in dealing with immigrants or people with an immigrant background?

Private:

They do not know.

Public:

M4 said that gate-keepers treat applicants well though applicants refuse to co-operate with the procedures. M3 said that it all depends to the character of the gate-keeper, some see the employment of a foreigner as being a humanitarian action while others see such a thing loaded with nationalistic feelings and thus behave badly toward immigrants.

P: As long as the employer receives the expected work efficiency the judgment is not based on ethnicity.

18. Do you know of any immigrants who play gatekeeper roles? Are there many or few? Explain.

Private:

M1 knows about many and M2 does not know of any.

Public:

They do not know.

P: He does not know.

19. What mechanisms explain relatively high unemployment among immigrants and their difficulties in obtaining a job?

Private:

M1 said that unemployment among immigrants is too high but he does not know why while M2 said that there is no unemployment since immigrants come for a specific occupation.

Public:

M3 does not know while M4 said that there is no unemployment.

P: He does not think that there is unemployment among those groups and that immigrant may come to the office for fulfilling certain procedures.

20. In your judgment, to what extent are differences between natives and immigrants in obtaining jobs dependent on active discrimination on the labour market? Explain. Or are the patterns mainly the result of concerns about the reactions of other employees and/or clients?

Private:

M1 said that an employer will give less money to an immigrant so he can exploit him and make more profit and M2 said that discrimination occurs against G/C workers since the employers prefer to employ low-paid, unqualified (foreign) employees.

Public:

M3 said that they prefer asylum seekers that employers can exploit while M4 said that there is no discrimination by the employer but a client may discriminate against a foreign worker giving the example of certain Cypriots who don't want to be served by foreign workers in restaurants.

P: there is no active discrimination. Generally there is a high trend to employ foreigners in unqualified sectors since G/C reject such positions. In the case of asylum seekers the problem is created by the fact that qualified applicants lack written documents to prove their qualifications.

21. Do labour unions oppose and try to restrict the recruitment of immigrants? Or, are there established cases of labour unions supporting the recruitment of immigrants?

Private:

M1 said that there are many companies that need cheap labour but the unions oppose to that and M2 argued that unions help only their members.

Public:

M3 does not know and M4 although she does not know about immigrants she knows about a T/C who told her that unions bring organised T/C groups of employees and they are paid less than G/C workers.

P: Union are open to help and they don't engage in discriminatory action.

22. Or, are other factors operating to explain differences in employment/unemployment patterns between immigrants and natives. Such explanatory factors might be, for instance, a lack of necessary education or skills, or lack of language competence? Which?

Private:

M1 said that all these factors mentioned in the question account for employment pattern differences and M2 said that lack of language knowledge create such differences .

Public:

They both said that language is an important factor defining such differences and M3 added that the specific work positions, that are low-paid and un-qualified, are reserved for immigrants since Cypriots refuse to take such positions.

P: It all depends on skills since they are the objective measure to judge an employee.

23. In what sectors are there the greatest barriers to recruitment of immigrants? Explain. To what extent are their barriers in the public sector [in country] to immigrant recruitment? All levels? Which sectors are the most open in recruiting immigrants? Explain.

Private:

M1 and M2 said that in the public sector there are barriers because immigrants don't have the citizenship. M1 argued that the private sector is more open especially in agriculture and constructions and M2 agreed adding that the openness of the private sector is due to the low wages given to immigrants since G/C refuse to work in such occupation. .

Public:

M3 said that in the public sector there are barriers because immigrants don't have the citizenship. M3 argued that the private sector is more open especially in agriculture and constructions, factories, and stock-breeding and that the wages in these sectors re lower. M4 said that asylum seekers have the same political rights as G/C yet they are not preferred for employment. As far as T/C are concerned there have been a lot of applications for employment and 10% of those applications has already been approved.

P: The public sector is closed for immigrant workers since there is a big pool of G/C claiming the positions. However, an immigrant can apply for a position in a municipality but in these cases the policy maker referred to positions that are of unqualified nature and G/C workers don't want them. The private sector is more open while the positioning of an immigrant to a specific occupation depends on his qualifications.

24. Are there forms of recruitment, e.g. types of announcement, that discriminate against immigrants? Is there a form or forms of announcement that distinguish immigrants from natives? Explain.

Private:

M1 said no and M2 said that there are specific forms that immigrants must fill.

Public:

They both said no.

P: There is no form of discrimination. If a discriminatory action occurs in the procedure is not based on intention but due to habit.

25. How is competence typically judged? Does it operate to the advantage or disadvantage of immigrants? Explain

Private:

M2 said that employers decide.

Public:

They both stressed factors such as the employee to be hard-working, productive, and have qualifications as well.

P: Competence is judged by the qualification and experience the applicant has.

26. Does discrimination arise simply on the basis of the preferences of an employer?

Private:

Discrimination arises when the employer wants to make profit out of foreigners. M1 said “cheap labour + exploitation equals to profit making”.

Public:

They both said yes.

P: As Labour office they don't engage in discriminatory actions. Employers may discriminate not however on the basis of ethnicity but rather on using some other criteria such as wanting to hire a beautiful woman.

27. To what extent are immigrants hired more than natives in marginal or deviant sectors?

Private:

They both said that immigrants work in the most deviant and marginal sectors is what we call cheap labour market and M2 added that this is because G/C don't want such positions.

Public:

They both said that immigrants work in the most deviant and marginal sectors is what we call cheap labour market and M3 added that this is because G/C don't want such positions.

P: Immigrants accept such positions by their own free will since they are in deed. He added though that some immigrants refuse to take such positions.

28. How do labour market laws and regulations function in these marginal or deviant sectors?

Private:

They do not know.

Public:

They do not know.

P: The legal provisions are followed and are imposed in an appropriate manner yet the laws of demand and supply also regulate the nature of the market.

29. Do qualified immigrants most often get unqualified or low-status jobs and

positions?

Explain.

Private:

Immigrants get such jobs since they have no other option (M2) and because G/C don't want such positions since they are well educated (M1).

Public:

M4 said that immigrants demand such positions and M3 said that such positions are reserved for immigrants.

P: It all depends on the qualifications and he added that certain qualified immigrants agree to work in unqualified occupations.

30. Are there key persons in firms and government offices who can restrict or facilitate ("gate keepers" such as personnel chiefs and others working with personnel questions):

- a) immigrants obtaining jobs
- b) immigrants having a normal career in a place of work.
- c) Special educational programs

Private:

M1 said that there are people restricting immigrants in all of the above and M2 argued that restriction occurs only when the migration office does not give the work permit.

Public:

M4 said that she does not think so and M3 argued that this occurs only when an immigrant is deported.

P: There are no such persons.

31. Do you know of persons with immigrant background who have such positions? Where? [if any]. Explain.

Private:

M1 refuses to answer the question and M2 does not know.

Public:

They don't know.

32. What prejudices and stereotypes do some of these key persons have which affect immigrants' fate on labour markets?

Private:

M2 said that it depends on the individual personality but he is unaware of such cases.

Public:

M4 said that what it should be blamed is not the prejudice or discrimination factors but the bad behaviour of the applicants.

P: There are no such persons.

33. Do you know of employers that have been accused of discrimination against immigrants? Indicate these? Were their judicial processes initiated? Are there employers in this area that have a reputation for positive recruitment of immigrants? Indicate a few, if any.

Private:

M1 said that he knew many cases in which some workers complained for their low salary and the employer sent them back to their countries although judicial process initiated. M2 was also aware of complaints made and were resolved in the Labour Office.

Public:

They both don't know.

P: There are cases of rights violations made deliberately by the employer or violations due the immigrants' ignorance of their rights. In such violations the Labour Office intervenes and since the employer needs a permission to hire foreigners in most cases the dispute is resolved. in the case of dismissal there is no discrimination since there are regulations applied for every employee despite of his ethnic origin. P added that he does not know of employers having good reputation though he knows of big firms that comply with the Labour Office demands on the employment of immigrant.

Task 4: Key Observations and Conclusions

From the 4 sources of information (3 areas of study – workplace, labour market, schools and the experts) one is able to gain an insight into the operation of daily racism and how this is perceived and articulated by various ‘actors’ in society. Of course for a full understanding and appreciation of the various complex and deeply-rooted dimensions of racial discrimination as institutionalised patterns, as social patterns of social behaviours, other sources of information references and other methodologies would best supplement the interview – based research in WP4. From the various Reports one is able to locate multiple levels, manifestation and dimensions of racial discrimination. Structural or systemic discrimination is easily demonstrate via the interviews and the reports written

Theoretical Questions

When examining the three fields of the study with their sub-categories (a) Labour marker mediators (public and private (b) Work places (public and private) and (c) education (at different levels, public and private) one can identify a systemic problem which can be seen generic discrimination. This *systemic* or *generic discrimination* against marginalized ethnic groups (migrants, Roma, Turkish-Cypriot workers who reside in the south)⁵ must be then contextually located in the specific ways discrimination is manifested at different levels of analysis. (a) It can be located as an *articulated discourse of exclusion* or (b) as an institutional mechanism which produces discriminatory patterns, or (c) individual strategies within which careers are advanced or blocked. The highly particular, even personal experience where structure meets agency, where institution meets the citizens and non-citizens where policy meets specific implementation, where declared goals meet social praxis.

To what extent then is the ‘institutional gatekeeper’ *an independent, free floating and autonomous factor*, whose own prejudices, biases, subjective perception, goals and agenda are capable of including, or excluding the marginalized and *racialised* ‘other’? Conversely, to what extent is the ‘gatekeeper’ only ‘relatively autonomous’ and ‘structurally bound’ as a *‘träger’* (in German) or *‘carrier’* of what is more or less a ‘given’ or ‘structurally framed set of alternatives’ in determining *‘who is in’* and *‘who is out’* in the various modes of social exchange, communication, production and reproduction?

⁵ In the Turkish controlled north the marginal groups are poor Anatolian settlers who have arrived very recently in search for work, the Romas and Greek Cypriot so-called “enclaved” who live in Karpasia / Karpas peninsula. This would be an interesting area of study particularly if it takes the fact of detailed disinterment of the intractable Cyprus problem and takes a comparative dimension with the south.

To what extent in the ‘knowledge’ possessed by gatekeeper with role of ‘guarding’ the ‘grant entrance’⁹, to the nebulous social mode of belonging, which is soaked and enmeshed in power – structures in society? To what extent in there room for manoeuvre and social action in a world so enmeshed in ideology – where the ‘real’, the ‘symbolic’, the ‘ideological’, the ‘fantastic’ are all products of contest, negotiation and socially determined?

At the heart of the extent to which ‘bias’ and liberal ideal which promotes with vigour ‘rules against bias’, ‘natural justice’, ‘due process’, ‘procedural justice’ and ‘fair play’ lies a fundamental debate over who is at the end of the day the ‘real’ carrier of power; who is in charge and what can be done about it. So when we are referring to the issue of ‘racial discrimination’ in whatever shape or form the debate is fundamentally one of whether it is the ‘individual’ who is endowed with ‘freedom of choice’ (this God – given or nature – given fundamental human quality and good) to act and determine the future or it a systemic, structural and social who determine matters. At the one extreme there are those who would theorise, on that I would call the individualistic or atomistic perspective, crudely described as the bad apple theorem where policy is to be directed at enlightening, educating and reforming individuals and punishing those individuals responsible. At the other extreme is the ‘total structure’ theory. No less there is radical and complete transformation of the structures of power, social relation nothing will change¹⁰.

Analysis of the Findings

Experts suggest that there are different reasons for discriminatory practices in Cypriot society: Stereotypes by employers, opportunistic exploitation of weaker position, ‘concern’ about what other employees say or what clients say. Others point to the inadequacy of the mechanisms to tackle discrimination illegal framework. Others pointed to the fact that racism also derives from the political problem of Cyprus. Most experts considered that trade unions are not playing a positive role in tackling racism and discrimination against migrant workers as well as Turkish Cypriots. Some experts were particularly critical of the way trade unions have stereotypes and are xenophobic¹¹ (see Experts Report). Interestingly very few, if any of the experts interviewed had a genuinely ‘global’ picture (i.e. a *holistic* picture of the various dimensions of ‘racial’ or ethnic discrimination in Cyprus). From the answers given, it was apparent that their views on the intensity, significance and regularity of the incidents and behaviour depended heavily on the kind of work they were involved in, hence the disparity of views on subjects such as the low score of the likelihood of discrimination in education and schooling.

Discrimination and Education

In spite of the abundance of evidence of everyday ‘racial’ discrimination, the vast majority of teachers and educationalist interviewed are either unaware or refused to admit it: the school, which is in theory ‘open’ to all, and must be so in line with the law and international democratic principle is neither open, nor accessible to the marginalized and racialised other. Systemic, institutional or structural racism seems to be deeply and routinely institutionalised to such an extent that it that has become part of *everyday normality*. Racism has thus been *normalised*. Whether due to naivety, or due to other reason that made them unwilling to recognise it this, teachers, in particular, who are the ‘*daily*’ or ‘*everyday*’ gatekeepers at the lowest echelons of the

chain of command to exercise authority within the class seem to be either *ignorant*, or *plainly uncaring*. Reflecting perhaps the language of a normative officialdom, which declares the liberal ideal of education as individual enlightenment and emancipation, this attitude should come not as a surprise. There is a vested interest to say (a) ‘we are in control of the situation’ and (b) ‘things are OK for all’. Therefore the near unanimity should have been anticipated. At general level, even anti-racism experts, NGOs and activists (such as many of the persons interviewed in this study – see Expert Report) at the level of generality *schooling and education is prima facie open to all*. The reality is of course something entirely different.

In education, at the level of schooling (rather than education policy-making which is a different balling a me altogether) systemic or structural discrimination cannot be properly understood unless linked and concretely located to the specific manifestations of racialised activity – with all the contradictory processes this entails. One is able to locate multiple ‘modes’ or racial(ised) processes: The Ministry of Education, beyond the generally declared humanistic goals, has (a) policies on national curricula (official and hidden) and (b) a fiscal and budgetary policy based on normative assessment of political priority, need and plain expediency. Though the regular memoranda, the enormous sources and resources, the system of evaluation and promotion of teachers it can ‘govern’ (i.e. it can reasonably achieve the level of ‘consent’ and cooperation’ with teachers).

Nevertheless, one must appreciate how different ‘levels’, priorities, intentionalities and personal / group interests and agendas at a local level operate to produce, and above all, reproduced the racialised subject. It is interesting that many educationalists, principals and teachers recognise the inadequacies of the education system:

- (1) There is essentially an *absence of multicultural or integration training* (i.e. none, if any of the newly appointed teachers, who are in a sense thrown in the deep end, are asked to teach in an environment they are not familiar with and are not even given the proper theoretical and practical tools to handle). The fact that voluntary seminars are offered during the course of the year (i.e. after they begin their teaching is of little use).
- (2) There is an absence of any specialised and culturally aware teaching methods, no multi-cultural textbooks in an overall conservative ethnocentric educational system and curriculum. It is left to the school’s own devices to develop a local action plan and many teachers are simply not interested due to their own prejudices, ideologies, priorities etc.

Before examining the role of individual bias among ‘gatekeepers’ and ‘definers of the situation’ (and there is plenty of evidence to support that there is a serious problem at that level), *we venture to argue that the primary cause of the racialisation or migrants, ethnic minorities and communalities lies squarely with the policy goals and policy-making*. This is the starting point of analysis.

Discrimination and Schools

Ministry officials, policy-makers and persons in authority do recognise that there are problems in the educational policy implementation as regards the pedagogical aspects of multicultural education in Cyprus. They have no problem in admitting that there are gaps and difficulties. One expert / educational psychologist suggested that Cyprus is in an ‘infantile’ stage, in 2001 a study on the educational issues relative to the

Pontians referred to inter-cultural or multicultural education as ‘embryonic’ (Trimikliniotis, 2001a). The key person appointed by the Ministry of Education to develop multicultural policies in the primary schools denied there are any discriminatory practices (as one would expect) and referred to the special educational program for teachers on inter-culturalism as a sign of change.

Teachers on the other hand complain that they do not have support; the training offered is an additional training seminars for those who are interested. None of the teachers who teach at the schools under study has received any training on multicultural education they are newly appointed, young and inexperienced, who necessarily all carry their own prejudice, within an ethnocentric, nationalistically-oriented educational system and national curricula geared so. The same findings were found three years before in three similar schools – *Faneromeni* Primary in Nicosia, the *1st Primary School of Limassol*, the *6th Primary School* of Pafos (see Trimikliniotis, 2001).

The intercultural education offered is nothing but a method for providing some extra teaching hours and for making allowances for the ‘cultural differences’ of migrants and other ethnic groups. It may well be the case that most schools attended by migrant and ethnic minorities and communities are located in deprived areas and are thus justifiably placed within the “Zone of Educational Priority”; as it is true that the vast majority of these persons are themselves in the lowest income and socio-economic brackets of the population. Nevertheless, the way in which the education of these groups are dealt with is that they are merely ‘linguistically inadequate’, which directs to the idea that they are somehow culturally deficient or deprived. This is in itself discrimination: not recognizing another group’s culture, tradition and belief is racist. Many teachers and policy-makers insist that education ought to take place only via the Greek language. The Romas speak Turkish; the other constitutionally recognized official language; yet the authorities insist that they are taught only in Greek. The result is exclusion and linguistic exclusion.

Language can be and is a major barrier in the educational advancement of a child. The appointment of a Turkologist in the 18th school is certainly a good measure. On the other hand the fact that this person has no actual role, no education responsibilities and is only there for strictly communication and translation goes to show what the content of the so-called ‘inter-cultural education’ is about:

“They didn’t even tell me what I am. Am I an escort? ‘No you are not they said. I still don’t know, and in the papers I write I still don’t know what I write... I come here I don’t know what to do...” (Interview with T.I. 3/2/04)

Not just pedagogical Discrimination

An important issue to be raised relates to the employment of migrant workers and ethnic minorities and communities: Migrants are not allowed to work in the public service. In schools persons who do not have a Cypriot passport, even though locally the schools as well as the Ministry would like to employ migrants. Why hasn’t this materialised? The answer is of a *complete* story of racial discrimination at different levels of society: The denial of fundamental right to work and equal treatment is never addressed. The teachers unions and parental associations are against any such

development that will open the possibility of migrants and non-assimilated minorities to work in public schools.

Educational reform has been on the cards for years now; the current government has a declared policy, as set out in its manifesto to work towards educational reform. Hence, we have the recent publication of a bulky Report for reform; but this is only a proposal in paper. It must be recognised that this Report is thorough, comprehensive and proposes a radical shake up of the system in the direction of tolerance, anti-racism, democratisation and humanistic education. Simultaneously, the Ministry has proposed some measures in the direction of recognition of the Turkish-speaking communities in the areas under the control of the Republic, with the introduction of Turkish as a subject on a voluntary basis for all children. Considering that this is one of the two official languages of the Cyprus Republic, it may sound like hardly a step forward. Nevertheless, considering the historical baggage and the fact that the divided education system between a Greek and a Turkish education system precedes the establishment of the Republic in 1960 and has continued right through today, it is an important step.

We are well aware how slow, typically incremental and contradictory any change is and how large institutions with heavy bureaucratic systems are difficult to reform: A sort of bureaucratic inertia exists with resistance from Ministry bureaucrats, many of whom are ex-teachers bred and fed by the old system, very much ingrained in the bureaucratic procedures that reproduce the same sort of values. Over and above, there are vested interests and career factors that influence matters: The role of the Orthodox Church, whose 'ethnarchic' role is being questioned, cannot be easily altered. The church may appear weakened, withstanding the current impasse over the archbishopric throne, but it remains a powerful conservative force not so much because of the power of clerics and its enormous economic might, but due its function in the various ideologies of conservatism in Cyprus, vested interests within the educational system, conservative parents' association and teacher trade unionism. Complex rule systems can and do lead to problems and can throw the system in chaos, if the privileges and vested interests are threatened. The educational system is based on a strict hierarchical system of rules, which is based on 'order' and 'functioning'. Inevitably the compromises that are made so that the 'functioning' of the system is continued, may slow down and at times stall altogether any attempt at reforms, if indeed reform is actually sought.

There is an inherent contradiction between humanistic, democratic and multicultural education, which recognises, tolerates and respects difference and the so-called Helleno-Christian ideals, which are cultivated as underlying values for all public school-children's education. The straight-jacket of Helleno-orthodoxism is exclusionary as it necessarily excludes all groups that are non-Greek and non-Christian Orthodox, no matter what additional activities, programs and methods are employed. The so-called Helleno-Christian ideals were nothing but the ideological construct for the various dictatorships in Greece and cannot continue to form the basis of a modern European educational system committed to anti-racism, anti-discrimination, as provided in the anti-discrimination laws and directives, democratic, humanistic and universal values as provided by UNESCO.

Analysis on Labour Market Mediators

The most obvious observation arising from the mediators' responses is that there appears to be a network of vested interests defining the terms of employment for vulnerable groups such as those of the immigrant, ethnic minority, and T/C workers. This is also the finding from the 20 interviews of experts who all stressed this. Public and private organisations set up to search and allocate '*foreign*' workers in several positions are seen as part of a mechanism operating to assist the *invisible hand* of the free market. Therefore, even prior to recruitment, the member of the racialised vulnerable group becomes '*an asset*', as one private mediator described them, in other words migrant persons in particular are in the process transformed and reified into commodities with the essential characteristic of generate profit: i.e. production at the lowest cost and thus maximisation of profit for the employer. The prime institution *defining* this set of characteristics is the market personified which essential represents the interests of employers. Thus, both private and public mediators 'function' as assisting institutions to fill in the shortage of labour supply in economic sectors and jobs for unqualified and low skill employees. Hence, there is a contradiction in the mediators' stories: while they argue that qualifications are important for an applicant to get the position, the positions reserved for these applicants are those which are actually rejected by the G/Cs for being low-paid, low-skill and of low social status. The *meritocracy* element in the recruitment process appears more like a political correctness which veils over since there is a pre-destined policy for members of the vulnerable groups to full-fill the 'needs' of the employers at the lowest labour costs. It is not surprising that many of the responses indicated no discriminatory action against vulnerable groups in matters concerning recruitment, wage differences, and opportunities of career development since the core of discrimination, or the genesis of differential treatment, is based on the fact that immigrants, ethnic minorities, and T/Cs are by and large confined to business sectors in which the super-exploitative nature of employment precedes the actual positioning in employment. In other words, there is an embedded set of working conditions established within certain occupations such as in agriculture, construction business, and house-keeping defined by the employers whose expectations of high efficiency at a low cost is fulfilled by the intervention of the *search and find* function carried out by mediators. Lack of antagonism from G/C workers, who refuse to undertake such employment positions creates a *sanctuary* for an assumed purification of the exploitative conditions since in the specific market vulnerable groups are drafted, in the words of one mediator by their sheer '*need*'. However, this apparent 'humanitarian' dressed mantle disguises the actual motive and 'real function' of profit-making interests that develop ways by which the absolute disadvantage faced by the vulnerable groups in their countries of origin is displaced as a relative advantage through employment in Cyprus, despite the fact that these employment positions are in fact a *supply monopoly* for an under-class pool of labour.

The procedure per se of employing an immigrant worker is loaded with racist pre-dispositions. The responses indicated that apart from the prime requirement, that is low-paid, low skilled and largely un-qualified personnel, the employers add a secondary set of characteristics involving preferences such as the requirement for so-called '*nice looking foreign women that are healthy and clean*', or proceed to recruitment only after examining the candidate's appearance by viewing his/her photo. Such preferences do not depart from the discriminatory basis; they in fact

accentuate the parameters and the complexity of the prime discriminatory mode (i.e. the employee-outsider as a profit-making tool) to the employers' *additional* preferences which determine in a racialised (and gendered) manner the aesthetics of discriminatory behaviour in a manner reminiscent of un-free labour or slavery.

Additionally, we see that legal regulations establish hierarchies within the vulnerable/racialised groups, in other words, there is a stratification system based on the employment and immigration rule and regulations, which allocate differential opportunities, barriers, rights, obligations and privileges in employment for each category.

- (1) The so-called 'third county immigrants' are granted the least degree of employment freedom since they are employed in is specific jobs, which they cannot change, and are thus are completely dependent to their employer's decision to keep them. Otherwise, as one mediator so eloquently put it, they are told, to '*pack their things and go back home*'. There is an open issue here about the specific interpellation of different ethnic groups of migrants; for instance the position of the Pontian Greeks is a contested one.
- (2) Asylum seekers (not yet acquired refugee status) can undertake many work positions as long as there is a demand for such labour and a shortage of supply by G/C workers; in other words, a certain degree of freedom exists, but confined *only within sectors that employ unqualified labour*.
- (3) Finally, as one policy-maker said 'Turkish-Cypriots and political refugees have the same rights as G/C' but as the other mediators pointed out, these groups are also drafted into low-skill and low-paid occupations. In the case of Turkish-Cypriots only a 10% of the applications for employment have been 'approved' in the bureaucratic procedures to obtain employment in the south; a proportion indicating institutional inertia to the public service's procedures.

Finally the mediators mentioned the issue of *bad reputation*. Mediator 3 said that certain ethnic groups are stigmatised by generalizations of possessing certain traits of deviance and thereafter the stigma blocks their employment opportunities since employers avoid hiring people coming from specific ethnic background. Prejudice and discrimination is not confined to the employers cycle but is dispersed through out the institutions. Mediator 4 holds a position that includes a responsibility to assist immigrant workers; the position is supposed to be an assisting institutional link of the immigrant to the labour market. Yet mediator 4, in a shocking manifestation of candour, argued that she does not send specific ethnic groups, such as the Pakistanis, to work-interviews because she thinks that they '*smell bad*'. The subjectivity and inherently biased evaluation creates and reproduces an appalling discriminatory generalization that 'all Pakistanis smell bad'. It is clearly an abuse of power, contrary to the laws against discrimination, since the position gives her the '*right*' (*or better the privilege*) to block the employment access of certain groups. Such a behaviour by a key player raise important questions about the abysmal gap between official regulation on the one hand, and actual implementation of anti-discriminatory behaviour on the other. Furthermore, the fundamental issue of how a person in a key position of power *actual becomes the position*, and can manipulate the power vested in the specific post to actualise her prejudice to exclude specific ethnic groups from employment. In modern days, in European contexts it is rather bizarre and very rare

find an experienced public officer to openly admit direct discrimination defying the law and its consequences.

Public Work-place analysis

The interviews in the municipality have shown have not produced evidence of discriminatory behaviour against vulnerable groups; but this can be easily explained as legal provisions forbid altogether the entry to employment for immigrants in these posts. The fact that legal arrangements prohibit the employment of an immigrant to permanent full-time positions altogether is itself direct discrimination in its own right; whether legally justified or not. Thus, a ‘foreign’ worker may only apply for positions of limited time length for which G/C workers refuse to work since they refer exclusively to seasonal job-opportunities of low-paid and by and large unskilled status. The leader and the employees expressed their lack of knowledge in matters concerning ‘foreign’ workers. They are only aware of some Turkish-Cypriots who worked occasionally in low skill temporary occupations- since the municipality is monopolised by Greek-Cypriot employees. The inexperience of working with such groups may create a kind of secluded and rather sterile work environments, which meant that the absence of immigrants, ethnic minorities and Turkish-Cypriot as colleagues *prevented* the interviewees from expressing opinions of experiences they never had and therefore they cannot speak of discrimination in their *daily* work or work place, but not at an inter-personal level (where they may joke and use stereotypes as a matter of routine).

When it comes to the interviews conducted in the police headquarters immediately one can recognise the loaded discriminatory tone in the language of the police leader. He immediately, before even the interview begun, said with a raised voice “*don’t ask me about Turkish-Cypriots*” and then when referring to the recruitment of immigrant workers he added “*Immigrants? Forget it*”. Furthermore, there have been several contradictory responses by the leader; despite the fact that Turkish-Cypriots and immigrants are excluded from employment in the Police force, he argued that the adjustment of a newcomer depends upon character and that many minorities refuse to adjust to the Cypriot society’s norms since they have a different culture value system. Furthermore he added, “*Ethnic minorities; they don’t want fit. As for Turkish-Cypriots let them out. Maronites and Armenians have already assimilated.*” The interesting element in this quote is that there is a complete neglect in referring to the laws prohibiting the entrance of immigrant members to the public work-place and at the same time a displacement of responsibility of the inability to adjust to factors bearing the ethnic element. This prejudiced language reveals a scapegoating predisposition; in other words there is a remedy for fitting-in and this is prescribed in the full assimilation within the value system of the Cypriot society. Any deviation from the prescription is due to a vague deficiency rested upon the members of the vulnerable group themselves.

Finally, another indication of prejudice arising from the police interviews is connected to comments referring to the ethnic minorities as being over-represented as employees in the work force. The leader argued that generally, minorities working in the police are not only represented according to the proportion in the population (Armenians and Maronites), but ‘*are more than enough*’ and he added about their career opportunities:

“*What I can say, is that Armenian and Maronites have priority*”. There is of course a contradiction in this argument. Firstly, there has been the notion that recruitment and promotion in the police force occurs through the evaluation of certain fixed criteria and therefore discrimination cannot take place since Greek-Cypriots and minority groups have to possess this set of evaluation indicators. However, the comment made by the leader indicates ill-feeling, with undertones a reverse discrimination argument, that somehow ‘Greek-Cypriots are victims’ since minorities have preferential advantages in recruitment and promotion. The underlying subtle discrimination and prejudiced disposition can be traced to the perception of a democracy working for the benefit of the majority, i.e. the G/C. At the same time despite the fact that ethnic minorities have equal rights as G/C and have assimilated into the mainstream culture they are still identified as the other, or the outsiders that ‘*invade and steal*’ opportunities that should be reserved for the ‘*We the majority*’.

The extent of discrimination within the Police force as a work place ought not be conflated with the wider role and function in society at large. Nevertheless there are obvious links and connected discourses at play. The Experts, in this Report, cited the Police the most likely force that is discriminating against migrants, ethnic and minority groups.

Analysis Private work-place

The interviews in the two private places reveal that the nature of the market, or rather industry sector, define the roles that the G/C, immigrants, ethnic minorities, T/C, institutional arrangements can play. In the case of the College under investigation, the relationships unfolded toward immigrants/ ethnic groups are characterised by a dual identity in which the *outsider* is not only *labour* (i.e. employees) but also clients (i.e. students who pay fees). The clientelistic links, as well as the social identity of the institution as a *high educator supporting cultural poly-vocality* creates the conditions for rather advanced institutional rules and regulations to block incidents of discriminatory action or prejudice within the workplace and the academic environment. There are in place anti-discriminatory prevention procedures, not only within a set of official regulations governing the code of behaviour of the organization, but also through a well-organised system of screening Greek-Cypriot employees and applicants in the recruitment and evaluation process. The leader argued that there were two incidents in which two employees were disqualified due to their prejudiced ideas. As far as the specific workplace is concerned another important difference which accounts for the absence of discriminatory action against immigrants, or at least lack of relative disadvantage, is the type of employment immigrants in this case are called to perform. Generally, the college wants to fill academic positions for which the recruitment requires applicants holding specific high-standard academic qualifications such as research experience, prestigious degrees, etc. Thus immigrants in the specific case are not called upon to perform a function of a cheap unqualified labour force and therefore their status is more or less equalised with the one of the Greek-Cypriot employees. However, when it comes to student employees there are discriminatory practices occurring in a habitual sub-conscious manner enclosing certain positions to only Greek-Cypriots. IG reported,

“Yes there is an example of a Chinese student who is working at the cafeteria. At the same time in the reception of the Humanities building

there are Cypriot girls sitting there who are students. I never saw migrants who work at the reception.”

Discrimination is not absent in the case of the college; but it takes a more sophisticated form. The system is more rule-based, more advanced and there is certainly a high level of awareness of these matters.

The core element arising from the interviews conducted on the leader and employees of the hotel is that the organisation and the specific sector of economic activity (i.e. the tourist industry) depends on the quality and efficiency of the service provided to customers and thus characteristics associated to ethnic minority or immigrant background are of secondary value in the intrinsic institutional ‘function’. The values determining the employment of an applicant and the length of his /her staying in the job are *experience, hard-work and efficiency* indicating that the specific workplace has well established mechanisms of labour screening based on rational action and scientific management. If that were true, one should expect immigrants and ethnic minorities to hold high positions as well. However the leader reported that a 10% of the hotel’s employees is from immigrant background, yet he added that there is no immigrant working in the top management, as a supervisor or in the personnel office. It is therefore a valid argument to assume that despite the official policy for equal opportunities, immigrants fill in low rank work positions. The responses show that the ideal type of *rational action and value-free recruitment and evaluation*, supposedly carried out by the management and key actors, is implanted as an ideology to the employees’ perceptions or that the interview process fails to capture the instances of discrimination (employees have many disincentives to make allegations notwithstanding their own venerable position). In other words certain employees may have a distorted set of expectations. LA-HWI for example said that he is room service supervisor but the personnel manager said that he is a waiter and OS-HWI believes that if someone is delivering good work then he/she is going to be promoted despite the fact that she is working as a housekeeper for the past seven years. Despite the official policy for no discrimination against immigrants and ethnic groups there were reports for incidents concerning discriminatory action and prejudice on an unofficial level among colleagues coming from various ethnic backgrounds and discrimination carried out by gatekeepers. NJS-HWI said “*Me, for example I get paid lower than a Cypriot*” and that

“there is man working at the pool- cleaning the pool. He is an excellent barman and he asked them to work at the bar and they told him “we don’t like black people”.

Finally ES-HWI said that

“Yes I heard that Polish women are dirty but we are clean (she is from Philippines)”.

Public Work-place analysis

The interviews in the municipality have shown lack of discriminatory action against vulnerable groups since the legal provisions restrict the entry to employment for immigrants. These legal arrangements actually prohibit the employment of an immigrant to permanent full time positions altogether. Thus a foreign worker may apply for positions of limited time length for which G/C workers refuse to work since

we are referring to seasonal job-opportunities of low-paid and unskilled status. Thus the leader and the employees expressed their lack of knowledge in matters concerning foreign workers- they are only aware of some T/C that worked occasionally in low skill temporary occupations- since the municipality is monopolized by G/C employees and thus the inexperience of working with such groups create a seclusion, a kind of a sterilized work environment where the absence of immigrants, ethnic minorities and T/C as colleagues prevents the development of prejudice and discriminatory mechanisms. We say *prevent* because it is apparent from the stories given that prejudice exists and is expressed on an interpersonal level though it cannot progress as action within the public workplace since the arrangement per se excludes members of the vulnerable groups.

When it comes to the interviews conducted in the police headquarters immediately one can recognize the discriminatory tone loaded in the language of the police leader. He immediately , before even the interview begun, said with a raised voice “ *don’t ask me about T/C*” and then when referring to the recruitment of immigrant workers he added “*Immigrants ?forget it*”. Furthermore there have been several contradictory responses by the leader; despite the fact that T/C and immigrants are excluded from employment in the police force he argued that the adjustment of a new comer depends upon character and that many minorities refuse to adjust to the Cypriot society’s norms since they have a different culture value system. Furthermore he added, “*Ethnic minorities they don’t want fit. As for T/C let them out. Maronites and Armenians have already assimilate .*” The interesting element in this quote is that there is a complete negligence to refer to the laws prohibiting the entrance of immigrant members to the public workplace and at the same time a displacement of responsibility of the inability to adjust to factors bearing the ethnic element. This prejudice language reveals a scapegoating predisposition , in other words there is a remedy for fitting-in prescribed in the value system of the Cypriot society and any deviation from the prescription is due to a vague deficiency rested upon the member of the vulnerable group.

Interviews

TASK 1. (This task is my responsibility, i.e. complete some gaps from WP1)
NT.

TASK 2. Expert Interviews **Total of 20 interviews**

NAME	CAPACITY	DATE
1. OK	NGO	8/7/04
2. SK	Government Dept	14/7/04
3. DD	Journalist	12/7/04
4. DK	Lawyer /Amnesty	13/7/04
5. NI	Sociologist/ NG	28/8/04
6. ATs	NGO	19/7/04
7. M	Migrant Trade Unionist	23/7/04
8. GZ	NGO	28/7/04
9. G	Government Dept	28/7/04
10 GP	Journalist	5/8/04
11 TH	M P/ Journalist	31/8/04
12 KM	Lecturer/ lawyer	28/8/04
13. PK	Trade unionist/	
14. G.	Researcher	
16 K	NGO Activist	
17. P	Government Dept	
18. ND	Government Dept	6/8/04
19. KZ	Youth worker	5/8/04
20. MG	Lawyer	26/8/04

3. Institutional Case Studies

3. A. Private and Public labor market mediating organizations

3.B Major Private and Public Employers

28 interviews=7 x 4.

- **Nicosia: Police & College**
- **Limassol: Municipality & Hotel**

POLICE

NAME	CAPACITY	DATE
1. AS	Leadership)	19/7/04
2. Marina	Police officer)	21/7/04
3. Maria	Police officer at the barricade (police officer)	1/9/04

4. Pamos	Police officer at the barricade	police officer	1/9/04
5. Chrisis	Police officer at the barricade	police officer	1/9/04
6. Marios	Police officer at the barricade		1/9/04
7. Michael	Police officer at the barricade		1/9/04

COLLEGE

NAME	CAPACITY	DATE
1. GG	Leadership- Director of the engineering Dep	15/7/04
2. MM	Campus Director personal Assistant	28/7/04
3. ST	Computer labs	28/7/04
4. CH	Student Advisor	28/7/04
5. IG	Student Advisor	2/7/04
6. KM	Educator	28/8/04
7. GK	Research Centre)	7/9/04
8. FI	Lecturer, former trade unionist	5/7/04

LIMASSOL MUNICIPALITY

NAME	CAPACITY	DATE
1. Koulis	Health inspector	29/7/04
2. Koralia	Executive engineer	10/8/04
3. Antonis Papis	Personel Manager	10/8/04
4. Theodoros	Technician,traffic-lights	
maintenance department		10/8/04
5. Michalis	Higher Secretarial Officer	10/8/04
6. Andreas	Accounting Officer	29/7/04
7. Yiannis	General inspector at the health board	29/7/04

In addition to the above we conducted 6 interviews with Turkish-Cypriots, who reside in the on employed in the southern area under the control of the Cyprus Republic

HOTEL

NAME	CAPACITY	DATE
1. Elma	Housekeeper	19/8/04
2. Ofilia	Housekeeper	19/8/04
3. Gurka	Housekeeper	19/8/04
4. Natalia	Bar waitress	19/8/04
5. Louai	Waiter	19/8/04
6. Irina	Receptionist	19/8/04
7. Sotiris	Personnel Manager	9/8/04

3C In each city, select a school.

Total of 12 = 6 + 6 interviews.

Nicosia: Faneromeni 6

NAME	CAPACITY	DATE	
1. Sotiris	Principal		
2. Lefkios	Teacher		
3. Marios	Teacher		
4. Andreas	Teacher		
5. Tsiakiros	Ministry of Education	7/9/04	J
6. Angelos	NGO : Association for Migrant Greeks		

Limassol: 18th School 6

NAME	CAPACITY	DATE
1. Anna	Principal	
2. Maria	Turkologist	
3. Kostas	Teacher	
4. Christos	ZEP Teacher	
5. Michalis	Education Psychologist	

Pafos 4th

NAME	CAPACITY	DATE
1. Argyris	Teacher	
2. Vaso	Teacher	
3. Georgia	Teacher	
4. Ms T	Principal	
5. Mr. Y	School Inspector	

Bibliography

Castells, M. (1973). *Mouvements Sociaux Urbains*, (Trans. Greek, *Η Πόλη και οι Κοινωνικοί Αγώνες*), Athens.

Ministry of Education and Culture (2004) *Δημοκρατική και ανθρώπινη Παιδεία στην Ευρωκυπριακή Πολιτεία*, August 2004.

Spirou, S. (2004) *Educational Needs of Turkish-speaking Children in Limassol*, funded by USAID and UNDP and executed by UNOPS, February-March 2004, Nicosia.

Trimikliniotis, N. (2003) "Freedom of Movement as Political Challenge: A Radical Potential", IKME (ed.) *Cyprus After A Solution - Left Policies*, IKME, Nicosia, 2003.

¹ The Report was written by Nicos Trimikliniotis, Yiannos Papayannis and Josie Christodoulou. The interviews were conducted by Josie Christodoulou, Eleftheria Vouti and Galateia Agathokleous. The conclusions and observations were written by Nicos Trimikliniotis and Yiannis Papayannis.

² See Statistical Survey.....

³ For more details on the Cyprus Police see <http://www.police.gov.cy/>

⁴ The Police Chief, Mr. Panayiotou said there was a "disproportionate" involvement of foreign students and asylum seekers or refugees in serious crime and urged authorities to expedite asylum procedures in order to contain the phenomenon, which he said created an additional problem for the police (see <http://www.cyprus-mail.com/news/main.php>). Such views were widely criticised from antiracist groups such as KISA, trade unions such as PEO and were applauded by dubious groups such as the self-appointed "News for defenders of the West and its people", an internet based paper called "*Occidental Herald*", 14/8/04.

⁵ According to the report by social Maro Antoniou 80% of Greek-Cypriots is over the age of 45 (See Antoniou, 2003).

⁶ «The only thing remaining is for them to come and enter our schools, to finish (their studies) and be appointed in our positions.»

⁷ «Construction workers, waiters, housekeepers ...»

⁸ Of course there are in between positions articulated in different ways which are very fruitful the way Hull draws on Gramsci's theory of *hegemony*, or Said's *fusion of knowledge-power with hegemony*, Habermas complex theories of *communicative action* etc. are out a few useful dynamic perspectives.

⁹ One is able see the analogy of typical *Kafkasque*, *The Trial* for example, of the 'guardians' of the gate of the law.

¹⁰ Of course there are in between positions articulated in different ways which are very fruitful the way Hull draws on Gramsci's theory of *hegemony*, or Said's *fusion of knowledge-power with hegemony*, Habermas complex theories of *communicative action* etc. are out a few useful dynamic perspectives.

¹¹ Currently there are 7,000 – 8,000 Turkish Cypriots working in the southern part of Cyprus and only 1,500 are registered and are members of the trade unions. However, there were trade unionists and some other experts point out that recent initiatives by Trade Unions illustrate that at least some Trade Unions are trying to organize migrant and Turkish Cypriot workers.